

City of Birmingham
Advisory Parking Committee
Regular Meeting

Held Remotely Via Zoom And Telephone Access
Wednesday, October 6, 2021

Minutes

These are the minutes of the Advisory Parking Committee ("APC") regular meeting held on Wednesday, October 6, 2021. The meeting was called to order at 7:33 a.m. by Vice-Chair Astrein.

1. Rollcall

Present: Vice-Chair Richard Astrein
Aaron Black
Lisa Krueger
Judith Paskiewicz
Lisa Silverman

Absent: Chair Al Vaitas
Steven Kalczynski
Sarshar Nasserian
Mary-Claire Petcoff
Jennifer Yert

Administration: Scott Grewe, Operations Commander
Ryan Weingartz, Parking Manager
Mike Albrecht, Police Commander
Laura Eichenhorn, City Transcriptionist

SP+: Catherine Burch

2. Introductions

Ops. Cmdr. Grewe welcomed Ryan Weingartz. Mr. Weingartz introduced himself and said he was glad to be joining the City.

3. Review of the Agenda

4. Approval Of Minutes: Meeting Of September 1, 2021

Dr. Silverman stated that under Meeting Open to the Public for items not on the Agenda "on Woodward between Maple and Brown or Chester" should be changed to "downtown".

With Mr. Black and Dr. Paskiewicz abstaining due to their absences from the September 1, 2021 meeting and with Chair Vaitas, Mr. Kalczynski, Ms. Petcoff and Ms. Yert absent from the present meeting the APC did not have a quorum for a vote on the minutes.

CT Eichenhorn stated the September 1, 2021 minutes should be returned for approval along with the October 6, 2021 minutes at the November 3, 2021 APC meeting.

5. Request to be included the Parking Assessment District (469-479 South Old Woodward)

Ops. Cmdr. Grewe presented the item. He noted that City Staff stated at the City Commission's October 4, 2021 workshop that the Parking Assessment District (PAD) was expired. Consequently, businesses could no longer be entered into the PAD. He also noted that his report recommended the request be denied even before it became clear that the PAD no longer existed.

Duraid Markus, owner, and Gayle MacGregor, attorney, spoke on behalf of the request.

Mr. Markus explained he would have to build four levels of parking underground in order to provide sufficient parking for the mixed uses that would be present on-site, which he said would be prohibitive. He requested the APC recommend that 469 - 479 S. Old Woodward be entered into the PAD, even though it no longer exists, to indicate to the City Commission that the APC would endorse some sort of dispensation of the parking requirements for said development.

Ms. MacGregor noted this request was submitted in December 2020 and had been put on hold until presently because of the City's ongoing discussions regarding the PAD. Consequently both she and Mr. Markus asked the APC to avoid tabling the conversation and to make either a positive or negative recommendation during the present discussion.

Mr. Black asked if the City might be able to provide clearer guidance regarding the PAD in a month if the item were tabled to the November 2021 APC meeting.

Ops. Cmdr. Grewe said it was unlikely that the issues surrounding the PAD would be sufficiently clarified in the intervening month.

A number of different points were raised by individual APC members, including:

- That this matter might be a zoning issue and therefore outside of the APC's purview altogether;
- That the zoning requirements for this parcel require mixed use but that there were not sufficient ways for the applicant to meet the parking requirements without the use of public parking;
- That the applicant was requesting a waiver of the parking requirements for a parcel in the S. Old Woodward area, where a number of parking spaces are likely to be removed during the S. Old Woodward project, which would cause an increase in parking demand in the area; and,
- That the APC could not vote to recommend one way or the other regarding the PAD since it seemed to no longer exist.

After APC discussion, Dr. Silverman moved to deny the request to include 469 - 479 S. Old Woodward in the PAD. The motion failed for lack of a second.

Ms. Krueger moved to approve the request to include 469 - 479 S. Old Woodward in the PAD. The motion failed for lack of a second.

Dr. Silverman and Vice-Chair Astrein both expressed discomfort in having to take action on this item with a number of APC members absent.

Vice-Chair Astrein said it was unfair to the applicant that they had been waiting since December 2020.

Motion by Dr. Paskiewicz

Seconded by Dr. Silverman to neither approve or deny the application to the PAD because it no longer exists. The APC requested that the City Commission return the issue to the AOC with other options to consider for the parking requirements of the applicant.

Ms. MacGregor said recommending that the request return to the APC was equivalent to making no recommendation. She reiterated her request that the APC either vote to maintain or relieve the parking requirements.

Motion failed, 2-3.

ROLL CALL VOTE

Yeas: Paskiewicz, Silverman

Nays: Astrein, Black, Krueger

Dr. Silverman motioned to recommend that the applicants not be relieved of the existing on-site parking requirements. The motion failed for lack of a second.

Ops. Cmdr. Grewe said the Vice-Chair could reasonably conclude the discussion by noting that the APC could not come to a consensus on this matter. He said that should provide the applicant with enough information to pursue next steps.

Ms. MacGregor thanked Ops. Cmdr. Grewe for his work on the item.

Vice-Chair Astrein noted that even if the APC had been able to recommend admission to the PAD the City Commission would be the final decisor.

6. Signage Update at Pierce, Park and Peabody Structures

Ops. Cmdr. Grewe summarized the item.

Motion by Dr. Silverman

Seconded by Mr. Black to approve the replacement of parking signs on all of the structures except Chester using Option F.

Ms. Krueger recommended that Option F be used but with the garage name larger than 'Parking' so that users more easily remember where they parked.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Paskiewicz, Silverman, Astrein, Black, Krueger

Nays: None

7. Meeting Open to the Public for items not on the Agenda

Vice-Chair Astrein stated that APC member attendance is critical and noted that increased APC member attendance may have allowed the APC to settle the matter of 469 - 479 S. Old Woodward.

8. Miscellaneous Communications

a. Construction Update

9. Next Meeting: Wednesday, November 3, 2021

10. Adjournment

No further business being evident, the meeting adjourned at 8:54 a.m.

Operations Commander Scott Grewe