

City of Birmingham
ADVISORY PARKING COMMITTEE
REGULAR MEETING

Birmingham City Hall Commission Room
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan
Wednesday, April 15, 2015

MINUTES

These are the minutes for the Advisory Parking Committee ("APC") regular meeting held on Wednesday, April 15, 2015. The meeting was called to order by Chairman Lex Kuhne at 7:38 a.m.

- Present:** Chairman Lex Kuhne
Julie Gheen
Anne Honhart
Steven Kalczynski
Lisa Krueger
Judith Paskewicz
Al Vaitas
- Absent:** James Esshaki
Vice-Chairperson Susan Peabody
- Central Parking:** Catherine Burch
Josh Gunn
Jason O'Dell
- Administration:** Paul O'Meara, City Engineer
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

RECOGNITION OF GUESTS (none)

WELCOME TO NEW MEMBER LISA KRUEGER

Ms. Krueger was introduced to the group. She indicated that she is a Birmingham resident, works for McCann Erickson, and is representing employees on this committee.

MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF MARCH 18, 2015

Motion by Ms. Gheen

Seconded by Dr. Vaitas to approve the Minutes of the Regular Meeting of March 18, 2015 as presented.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Gheen, Vaitas, Honhart, Kalczyński, Krueger, Kuhne, Paskewicz

Nays: None

Absent: Esshaki, Peabody

MONTHLY RATE INCREASE PROPOSAL

Mr. O'Meara advised the City has been able to keep parking rates, both daily and monthly, quite low for many years. When demand for parking spaces increased past the point where it can be regularly supplied in 2013, it began to appear that expansion of the current system may need to be planned. A case for higher rates can be made for two reasons:

1. The City's parking system is intended to be non-profit, collecting enough fees to cover its expenses, but not to create a profit. If it appears that one or two large parking projects are going to be undertaken, new debt will be incurred to cover the cost. If rates are high enough to both cover costs and build a savings account to be used on these upcoming projects, the amount of debt that will have to be incurred can be reduced.
2. If demand is higher than supply, the commodity being sold is worth more than the current price. The public will pay higher prices to get the parking services they need.

After discussions between the APC and the Principal Shopping District ("PSD") were held, a two-part recommendation to the City Commission was passed in May, 2014. It was the feeling of the Commission that the 2015 suggested rates may be too conservative. Rather than committing to a fee structure for 2015 too far in advance, the APC was asked to look again at the 2015 rate structure and propose additional changes for consideration by the City Commission, to be effective in the new fiscal year starting July 1, 2015.

The demand for parking is now very real, and it is expected to get more acute. Given the current environment, raising rates more aggressively may be appropriate. It also appears to be the direction that the City Commission is encouraging. Mr. O'Meara noted he has capped the rate increase to \$10/month.

Mr. O'Meara covered the various ideas and topics being considered by the City to improve the parking system:

- The Ad Hoc Parking Study Committee is now done and has submitted their parking study to the City Commission. That led to creating the Ad Hoc Parking Development Committee that will mostly focus on the N. Old Woodward Ave. property as well as the Pierce St. property.
- Opening of temporary Parking Lot # 11 at Oak and Woodward Ave.
- Exploration of shuttle service between churches on the west side of town. About fifty spaces have been negotiated. However, the shuttle service came in very expensive.
- Exploration of car pooling arrangement from the church lots with one big employer.
- Exploration of valet parking during construction projects. This is not viable because the Peabody structure is too crowded.
- Explore getting monthly permits out of Peabody while it is under construction and move 100 of them to Park or Pierce for the next three months free. That would cost the City \$19,500.
- Exploration of additional temporary gravel parking lots while they are underutilized.
- Implementation of "parking availability" message boards along with the new generation equipment being installed in the garages.

There were no comments from the public at 8 a.m.

It was noted that the precedent for raising the rates was set last year and the public may be used to the idea. Discussion considered holding a special meeting in the evening to hear what people are thinking about how to pay for increasing parking capacity. Tell people what the committee is thinking of doing and then ask them what they think.

Two tier pricing was talked about that would offer a lower rate for the top floors. The motivation is to get people off the first floor in order to leave room for transient parkers. Mr. O'Dell said that in a lot of garages they put another gate inside the garage and if the pass doesn't trip that gate the customer can't get out unless an additional fee is paid. He didn't feel there is enough space available to make that worthwhile. Another thing they could explore is a cheaper evening pass. Mr. O'Meara felt that night time permits would be a money loser. Chairman Kuhne thought the south side permit rate should only be offered to people who give up permits somewhere else. It may be attractive to people who are paying transient rates.

Motion by Dr. Vaitas

Seconded by Ms. Gheen. With the understanding that the Auto Parking System needs to implement methods to increase parking capacity both on

a temporary and long-term basis, monthly permit rate increases at the following levels are recommended in an effort to increase the system account balance available for future construction:

Effective July 1, 2015 -

Pierce St. Structure	\$ 65	(\$ 5 increase)
Park St. Structure	60	(10 increase)
Peabody St. Structure	65	(10 increase)
N. Old Woodward Ave. Structure	55	(5 increase)
Chester St. Structure	45	(5 increase)
Lot 6 Regular Permit	65/45	(5 increase)
Lot 6 Economy Permit	45	
Ann St.	50	(10 increase)
South Side Permit	25	(15 cut)

There was no discussion from the public at this time.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Vaitas, Gheen, Honhart, Kalczynski, Krueger, Kuhne, Paskewicz

Nays: None

Absent: Esshaki, Peabody

Mr. O'Meara announced that Peabody construction on up to two floors (2/7 of the garage) will begin in June. Anyone who has a permit there could go to Park or Pierce with a cap of 50 people for each garage. Those people would get a three month reprieve from their parking fee. (This is a loss to the City of \$19,500).

Motion by Ms. Gheen

Seconded by Ms. Paskewicz that the APC create amnesty for June, July, and August, 2015 for up to one hundred individuals from the Peabody Structure to have the option to move to Pierce or Park St. during construction of Peabody.

There was no discussion on the motion from members of the public.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Gheen, Paskewicz, Honhart, Kalczynski, Krueger, Kuhne, Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: Esshaki

AD HOC PARKING DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

Mr. O'Meara recalled that at their meeting of March 16, 2015, the City Commission heard the final presentation of the Parking Study Committee, and established a new committee, as titled above. The new committee will be a new group of stakeholders and experts coming together to lay out a timeline and priority list for the potential two upcoming projects at the Pierce St. and N. Old Woodward Ave. Structures.

This temporary committee will need input from someone representing the APC. It is suggested that the APC nominate a member to sit on this ad hoc committee to help represent the interests of the Parking System as these important upcoming decisions and directions are assembled for final consideration by the City Commission.

It was concluded that either Ms. Paskewicz or Ms. Gheen could serve on the committee, depending on what time the meetings are held.

PARKING SYSTEM CONSTRUCTION UPDATE (not discussed)

MONTHLY FINANCIAL REPORTS (not discussed)

MEETING OPEN FOR MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Mr. O'Meara reported that Commonwealth Cafe on Hamilton is expanding into the space next to them so they will have about 46 ft. of frontage instead of 23 ft. They will still only take two spaces for their dining deck.

Toast got their dining deck approved at the last City Commission meeting. They will take two parking spaces and have seating on the sidewalk as well.

Dr. Vaitas related that expired meter tickets in Los Angeles cost \$63. It was discussed that expired meter tickets are \$10 in Birmingham. Mr. O'Meara agreed to bring in facts and figures on how many expired meter tickets have been issued in Birmingham. Perhaps raising the fine would be another source of income for the City.

NEXT REGULARLY SCHEDULED MEETING

May 20, 2015

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, it was moved and seconded to adjourn the meeting at 9 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Paul O'Meara
City Engineer