

City of Birmingham
ADVISORY PARKING COMMITTEE
REGULAR MEETING

Birmingham City Hall Commission Room
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan
Wednesday, May 18, 2016

MINUTES

These are the minutes for the Advisory Parking Committee ("APC") regular meeting held on Wednesday, May 18, 2016. The meeting was called to order at 7:40 a.m. by Vice-Chairperson Susan Peabody for Chairman Lex Kuhne who arrived soon afterward.

Present: Chairman Lex Kuhne
Anne Honhart
Lisa Krueger
Judith Paskewicz
Vice-Chairperson Susan Peabody
Al Vaitas

Absent: Steven Kalczynski

SP+ Parking: Catherine Burch
Jason O'Dell

Administration: Austin Fletcher, Engineering Dept.
Paul O'Meara, City Engineer
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

RECOGNITION OF GUESTS (none)

MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF APRIL 20, 2016

Dr. Vaitas:

Page 3 - Item 5, add "Dr. Vaitas commented that raising the rates in the Lot 6 area is an effective deterrent for keeping employees from parking in front of the businesses."

Motion by Ms. Peabody

Seconded by Ms. Honhart to approve the Minutes of the APC Meeting of April 20, 2016 as amended.

Motion carried, 6-0.

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Peabody, Honhart, Krueger, Kuhne, Paskewicz, Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: Kalczynski

PARKING SYSTEM RATE CHANGE PROPOSAL

Mr. O'Meara recalled that last month a comprehensive package of rate changes was presented to the APC for review. Demand from employees is forcing the system to operate without sufficient capacity for shoppers and visitors who arrive later in the day. Additionally, revenue increases would help the parking system prepare itself for large expenditures in the future.

The APC was not prepared to endorse the rate changes at the last meeting. Requiring large blocks of employees to park their cars off site outside the downtown area is not looked upon favorably and changing the rates as suggested will not change their behavior. If the rate structure is going to be reconstructed, the rate of increase for the shorter time periods (three to seven hours) should be priced more aggressively too.

With the above in mind, various hourly rate pricing schemes were examined. Further, the system could offer an evening only monthly permit for those that arrive after 4 p.m. as long as they regularly leave the building after their shift (no overnight parking).

Implementing the same rate structure at all five facilities that was recommended at the last meeting on April 29 has the benefit of only impacting the long-term parkers. At Pierce St., long-term parkers are already paying this rate, so there would be no change for them. Revenues are predicted to increase about \$500,000/year.

There are currently about one hundred monthly permit holders (system wide) that routinely enter their parking structure after 4 p.m. to work an evening shift. The evening permit would not be as desirable, so a \$10 discount from the regular price is recommended. Removing an estimated 100 permits from the current monthly permit holders would allow a new 100 customers (system-wide) to purchase a monthly permit. That would bring an end to the long wait for some parkers.

Discussion considered that instead of raising the rates, take away the two hours free parking in the structures. Mr. O'Dell discouraged that thought. The free two hours was put in place to move people off of the street and into the structures and to allow people time to shop. Raising rates for the long-term is really to affect the all day parkers and get them into other situations. Ms. Burch suggested escalating the rate quicker for the all day parkers and keeping the two hours free because it is so popular.

Mr. O'Meara suggested a \$70 rate for the four garages other than Chester. Chester would be increased to \$50 with the idea that it is remotely located and the majority of people there would rather park somewhere else. Lot 6 two-tiered permits would be raised \$5 each. South side permits would remain at their present rate. This makes shuttles more attractive and gets in line with the market rates.

He noted that offering off-site parking to employers within the Central Business District at no charge to the employer, provided the employer finances the cost of transportation between the church lot and Downtown destination is deemed not to be a popular idea. However, the City will work with the employer as best they can to make it attractive.

The authorized number of monthly permits at Park St. and N. Old Woodward Ave. can be reduced through attrition. The garages are filling way too often right now and something needs to be done to get employees out.

At the N. Old Woodward Structure, valet on the top floor will be starting the first week of June roughly 9 a.m. to 2 p.m. Monday through Friday.

It was discussed that since the daily rate is going up, parking meter rates on Brown and Chester will change from \$.50 to \$1/hour.

Lastly, the group agreed with offering Evening Only Monthly Permits at all five structures allowing unlimited parking to permit holders (around one hundred permits) after 4 p.m. at a rate discounted by \$20/month. This incentivizes people to use the excess capacity at night and it frees up the daytime waiting list for permits.

The chairman took comments from the public at 8:30 a.m.

Ms. Julie Beels said her husband has a medical practice at 390 Park and they utilize five permits for their employees. Their patients are elderly or pregnant and they have had terrible parking issues since McCann Erickson moved in. The practice is losing patients because of this. She doesn't want to see the two free hours go away. Chairman Kuhne responded that the model of Birmingham's

Downtown has changed; not necessarily because of one development. It used to be a retail downtown and now it is a service downtown. Ms. Honhart suggested that Ms. Beels get together with the valet service to see if they can serve the patients. Committee members further suggested that she speak with John Heiney who is the conduit to the City on behalf of business owners in the City.

The group expressed preference for Alternate Rate Schedule D which expresses the charges in round numbers and tops out at \$10 for eight or more hours.

Motion by Dr. Paskewicz

Seconded by Ms. Honhart to recommend that the City Commission approve the following changes as discussed by the APC to reflect the current value of parking, and to help position the Auto Parking System Fund for future expected parking system capacity improvements:

1. Effective July 1, 2016, to change the daily parking rate at the Park St., Peabody St., N. Old Woodward Ave., and Chester St. Structures to match the rate currently in effect at the Pierce St. Parking Structure, wherein parking will be charged as follows:

<u>Time</u>	<u>Pierce St. Rate</u>
Less than 2 hours	Free
Less than 3 hours	\$1
Less than 4 hours	\$2
Less than 5 hours	\$3
Less than 6 hours	\$4
Less than 7 hours	\$5
Less than 8 hours	\$7.50
More than 8 hours	\$10

The above applies to charges applied prior to 10 p.m. every evening. Charges after 10 p.m. will have a maximum value of \$5.

2. Effective July 1, 2016, to increase the monthly parking permit rate at the majority of the parking facilities, as follows:

<u>Parking Facility</u>	<u>Existing</u>	<u>Proposed 7-1-16</u>
Pierce St.	\$65	\$70
Park St.	\$60	\$70
Peabody St.	\$65	\$70
N. Old Woodward Ave.	\$55	\$70
Chester St.	\$45	\$50
Lot 6 – Regular Permit	\$65	\$70
Lot 6 – Economy Permit	\$45	\$50
South Side Permit (Ann St.)	\$50	\$50
South Side Permit (S. Old Woodward Ave.)	\$25	\$25

3. To offer off-site parking to employers within the Central Business District at no cost to the employer, provided the employer finances the cost of transportation through their selected means, such as carpooling, shuttle, or valet, and as documented by separate agreement, with a maximum total value (for all employers) of \$30,000 per year.

4. To lower the authorized number of monthly permits by attrition at the following parking structures as follows:

<u>Parking Structure</u>	<u>Current Authorized Permits</u>	<u>Recommended Auth. Permits</u>
Park St.	815	750
N. Old Woodward Ave.	900	800

5. To increase the Chester St. and Brown St. parking meters currently set at 50¢ per hour to \$1 per hour.

6. To offer Evening Only Monthly Permits at all five parking structures, allowing unlimited parking to permit holders after 4 p.m. every day, at a rate discounted by \$20 per month over the regular monthly permit rate.

7. Implement the following hourly rate schedule:

<u>Time</u>	<u>Rate</u>
Under 2 hours	Free
2-3 hours	\$2
3-4 hours	\$4
4-5 hours	\$6
5-6 hours	\$8
6-7 hours	\$10
7-8 hours	\$10
8 hours or more	\$10
After 10 p.m.	\$5

Motion carried, 6-0.

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Paskewicz, Honhart, Krueger, Kuhne, Peabody, Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: Kalczyński

DINING DECK PROPOSAL

141 W. MAPLE RD.

Mr. O'Meara recalled that approximately four years ago, the APC approved the installation of a dining deck in front of Sweet Earth frozen yogurt shop. After

securing approval, the applicant elected not to proceed with the deck. They are now before the APC with the same request.

No plan has been prepared for this application. The applicant would like to take one parking space that is located primarily in front of the establishment. It would encompass about 90% of the frontage of the store, and measure about 20 ft. long. Assuming some space from the City sidewalk is also used, the width of the platform will be about 12 ft.

If the APC recommends approval for this request, it will proceed to the Planning Board for consideration. Since this request does not involve the serving of alcohol, the City Commission will not be asked to approve it. Approval from the APC and the Planning Board would complete the process.

Shana who works for the business owner, Mr. Ron Robinson, said they want to expand onto a deck so that people can sit down and talk with their friends. Currently they have two tables and fixtures on the sidewalk. Adding more tables would make it very crowded.

Chairman Kuhne noted the parameter of the ADC review is how it affects parking. It was discussed that because of the parking crisis adding a deck that takes up a parking spot may be sending a bad message.

Shana noted that people with dogs and strollers take up sidewalk area around the tables. They are really the only desert store in the Downtown area which is part of the reason they want to expand outside. Dr. Paskewicz was in favor of allowing the deck because it would add ambiance to the Downtown area.

Consensus was not to vote on the matter at this point. Committee members asked the applicant to talk to her neighbors and see if they would allow expansion over onto their sidewalk frontage. Also, Planning Staff can provide guidance on where to obtain small outside furniture.

Mr. O'Meara indicated the applicant would have to provide something in writing from the neighbors saying they approve the expansion idea. If this doesn't work out, the applicant can come back.

ACCESSIBLE PARKING SIGNAGE ICON

Mr. O'Meara said he does not like the proposed icon because of the liability issue. The signs are not official and they have not been approved by the State of Michigan. He would rather not be the trend setter on something that has to do with legal issues. Three handicap spaces will be set up on Hamilton using the

current signs. The entire Downtown doesn't have to be done until they are reconstructing a street.

CONSTRUCTION UPDATE (not discussed)

MONTHLY FINANCIAL REPORTS (not discussed)

MEETING OPEN FOR MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Next month's agenda will contain a request to move the APC meeting time back to the first Wednesday of the month. The problem is that the committee has lost the immediacy of contact with the Birmingham Shopping District because of the way their meetings are set up.

NEXT REGULARLY SCHEDULED MEETING

June 15, 2016

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:45 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Paul O'Meara
City Engineer