

City of Birmingham
ADVISORY PARKING COMMITTEE
REGULAR MEETING

Birmingham City Hall Commission Room
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan
Wednesday, October 26, 2016

MINUTES

These are the minutes for the Advisory Parking Committee ("APC") regular meeting held on Wednesday, October 26, 2016. The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Lex Kuhne.

Present: Chairman Lex Kuhne
Gayle Champagne
Anne Honhart
Judith Paskewicz
Vice-Chairperson Susan Peabody
Al Vaitas (left at 8:55 a.m.)

Absent: Steven Kalczynski
Lisa Krueger

BSD: Richard Astrein
John Heiney

SP+ Parking: Catherine Burch
Sara Burton
Jason O'Dell

Administration: Austin Fletcher, Asst. City Engineer
Paul O'Meara, City Engineer
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

Police Dept: Mark Clemence, Police Chief
Ellen DeView, Staff and Services Coordinator
Scott Grewe, Commander

RECOGNITION OF GUESTS (none)

MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF SEPTEMBER 21, 2016

Motion by Ms. Honhart

Seconded by Ms. Peabody to approve the Minutes of the APC Meeting of September 21, 2016 as presented.

Motion carried, 6-0.

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Honhart, Peabody, Champagne, Kuhne, Paskewicz Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: Kalczynski, Krueger

PARKING METER PURCHASE

Mr. O'Meara recalled that at the June Advisory Parking Committee ("APC") meeting, members of the Police Dept. attended the regular meeting to share information about the newest available parking meter technology.

The Police Dept. suggested that upgrading to individual smart meters would be the best approach for Birmingham. The APC agreed, and recommended that a test area be set up for the two systems offering the best package at this time. The test was implemented the first week of August. IPS brand meters were installed on the north side of Martin St. Between Henrietta St. and Pierce St., while CivicSmart meters were installed on the south side.

At the August regular meeting, the Police Dept. announced that after further analysis and fact finding, they continue to suggest the system using license plate recognition and pay station installations is not the right direction for Birmingham.

The Police Dept. provided a review of the results of the trial period, as well as a recommendation that the City proceed with the CivicSmart Liberty meters. The CivicSmart meters appear to provide the best package for a simple transition to multi-function meters both for the public, as well as for the staff. The meters will provide the customer with the current methods of payment, as well as the ability to use PINless debit or credit cards. Carl Walker Consultants reviewed the Police Chief's recommendation on the meter purchase and did not see an issue.

Chief Clemence reported as a result of the trial they saw a little over 19% increase in revenues from meters that use the Smart technology. The Civic Smart unit was by far the superior product. It has a number of different features that are important to the Police Dept. and to the City's operations. They also interface well with the Parkmobile system as well as the hand-held parking

enforcement units that are used to write tickets. A magnifying glass is built into the CivicSmart meter that makes it easier to read. Ms. DeView noted the meters accept coins.

Chief Clemence explained there are two options for credit card transactions. The cost of the transaction could either be built into the cost on the meter; or if a customer chooses to use a credit card, a service fee would show up on the credit card bill. This would be similar to the service fee that is charged by Parkmobile. Mr. O'Meara noted rather than raising rates, they are leaning toward charging a service fee for the use of credit cards. Notice of the service charge would appear on the meters. Chief Clemence added the fees CivicSmart will charge for credit card use are about half of the cost of IPS fees. So there would be substantial savings by using the CivicSmart rather than the IPS unit.

The chairman asked for public comments at 7:55 a.m.

Mr. Richard Astrein received confirmation that there would still be the ability for a grace period while the car remains parked.

Further discussion concerned charging a dollar minimum, but Chief Clemence did not see the advantage.

Mr. John Heiney observed he doesn't believe Parkmobile currently discloses on the meter how much their fee is. However it was noted that is disclosed on the app.

Mr. O'Meara advised if the APC passes the recommendation to move forward on this purchase, it is expected that the City Commission will review this item relatively soon. Since it will take several weeks to manufacture the number of meters involved, conversion will likely take place during the winter months, as the weather allows. It is anticipated that the purchase of 1,277 parking meters and vehicle detection sensors will cost approximately \$790,000, which was not budgeted. Even so, current parking system revenues will be able to accommodate this cost.

Motion by Ms. Paskewicz

Seconded by Ms. Champagne that the APC recommends that the City Commission approve the purchase of 1,277 CivicSmart Liberty parking meters, to be installed at all existing metered parking spaces throughout the Central Business District.

Motion carried, 6-0.

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Paskewicz, Champagne, Honhart, Kuhne, Peabody, Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: Kalczynski, Krueger

It is anticipated that staff will return with additional information relative to charging for credit card fees before that decision is finalized.

PARKING SYSTEM RATE REVIEW

Mr. O'Meara noted that at the April and May, 2016 meetings, the APC reviewed and studied rate changes for the parking system designed to increase revenues and to encourage larger employers to seriously consider off-site parking options for employees. A package of recommendations was sent to the City Commission. At their meeting of June 6, the City Commission approved most of the rate changes but declined to raise monthly rates at that time as had been recommended, indicating that the rate of increase was potentially not enough, and that this matter should be reviewed in more detail by the APC.

The changes that were authorized were implemented with the new fiscal year, starting July 1.

Historically, the APC has attempted to set rates such that:

- Parking on the street at a meter in the prime areas of the CBD is always in high demand. Setting the rate higher than any other parking is appropriate to encourage use of the parking structures. (Lower rates at meters that are further from the center of the City, or further from most destinations are appropriate given their lower demand.)
- Daily parking rates in the structures should be set to encourage short term visits into the structure at low cost, in an attempt to get this traffic off the street.
- Where space is available, monthly permits should be issued only to employees in the parking assessment district, providing a discount from the daily rate for regular visitors. Keeping the parking structure open and available to visitors is a higher priority, though, so a cap must be placed on monthly permits based on the daily demand.

Daily rates in the parking structures were changed recently, but monthly permits and parking meter rates were not. As a result, there is currently an imbalance where the above principles are not always in sync.

For short-term visitors, meter rates on street and lots in the Central Business District are recommended at \$1.50/hr. and in the outer limits \$1/hr. Parking Structure hourly rates are proposed as follows:

Less than 2 hours - Free
Less than 3 hours - \$2
Less than 4 hours - \$4
Less than 5 hours - \$6
Less than 6 hours - \$8
More than 6 hours - \$10

Long-term visitors with no permit would pay \$10/day.

For Pierce, Park, Peabody and N. Old Woodward Monthly Permits -	\$70
Chester Monthly Permits -	\$50
Lot 6 Regular Monthly Permits -	\$70
Lot 6 Economy Monthly Permits -	\$50
South Side, Ann St. Monthly Permits -	\$60
South Side, S. Old Woodward Monthly Permits -	\$35

It was noticed that in comparable cities the average monthly parking permit costs that are higher than in Birmingham occur mainly in college towns where a lot of people don't have cars.

The chairman asked for comments from the audience at 8:20 a.m.

Mr. Richard Astrein announced he is opposed to increasing the long-term rates in the structures. He explained that with three years of heavy street construction anticipated the increase puts an undue burden on the brick and mortar stores.

Motion by Ms. Champagne

Seconded by Dr. Vaitas that the Advisory Parking Committee ("APC") passed a recommendation approving the conversion of all Central Business District parking meters to smart parking meters. If and when that conversion takes place, the APC also recommends the following to the City Commission:

WHEREAS, the majority of the parking meters in downtown Birmingham have had the same rate structure since 1996, and

WHEREAS, other cities experiencing our level of demand now charge higher rates at their parking meters, and

WHEREAS, the rate being charged at the meters actually provides a lower cost per hour in some locations than what is charged in the parking structures, and

WHEREAS, the City has postponed an increase at the parking meters above \$1 per hour while offering coin only parking meters due to the large

number of coins that motorists would have to carry for longer term stays at the meters,

THEREFORE, now that the City is moving to offer both credit and PINless debit card payment features at its meters, as the new meters are installed, staff is directed to increase the current \$1 per hour parking meters to \$1.50 per hour, and to increase the current 50¢ per hour meters to \$1 per hour.

There was no further public comment.

Motion carried, 6-0.

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Champagne, Vaitas, Honhart, Kuhne, Paskewicz, Peabody

Nays: None

Absent: Kalczynski, Krueger

Motion by Ms. Champagne that this discussion regarding increased monthly rates, while important and applicable, be postponed until after all of the proposed street construction is completed

Motion died for lack of a second.

With respect to raising monthly permit rates, Mr. Richard Astrein noted the merchants will need all the help they can get while the roads are under construction, so he asked the committee not to go up more than they had proposed in April.

Motion by Dr. Vaitas

Seconded by Ms. Peabody with respect to monthly permit rate increase:

WHEREAS, demand for parking in the parking structures has increased substantially over the past three years, particularly from all day employees, and

WHEREAS, both the N. Old Woodward Ave. and Park St. Parking Structures are filling often, forcing the City to consider and activate various means to provide short-term alternate parking opportunities as well as preparing plans for long-term expansion of the system, and

WHEREAS, the demand for monthly parking permits at all five structures is much greater than can be satisfied given the current capacities available, and

WHEREAS, the parking system has implemented two annual rate increases for monthly permits both in 2014 and 2015, and

WHEREAS, the members of the Advisory Parking Committee ("APC") represent various interests in the Central Business District, and understand that all businesses need to be able to budget upcoming expenses in a reasonable manner, and

WHEREAS, the daily rate increase implemented in July for the parking structures is already impacting the budget of many of the same businesses that pay for employee parking in both forms (monthly and daily), and

WHEREAS, the monthly rate schedule suggested for this year reflects an appropriate amount as compared to other Midwestern mid-sized cities, and

WHEREAS, the APC deems these rates appropriate in light of the expected disruption of the Central Business District due to the construction projects tentatively scheduled for 2017 and 2019,

THEREFORE, the APC recommends that the monthly rate schedule suggested for this year be approved by the Commission, which represents an increase of 7% to 27% over what is currently being charged, as it will already represent a substantial impact on the budgets of downtown businesses, and further, can be increased again in 2017 as appropriate, as follows:

Pierce St.	\$70
Park St.	\$70
Peabody St.	\$70
N. Old Woodward Ave.	\$70
Chester St.	\$50
Parking Lot 6 – Regular	\$70
Parking Lot 6 – Economy	\$50
South Side (Ann St.)	\$60
South Side (S. Old Woodward Ave.)	\$35

There was no further public comment at 8:45 a.m.

Motion carried, 6-0.

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Vaitas, Peabody, Champagne, Honhart, Kuhne, Paskewicz

Nays: None

Absent: Kalczynski, Krueger

BSD HOLIDAY PROMOTION

Mr. John Heiney noted this is the fourth year that the BSD has asked this committee for assistance with the holiday advertising campaign. The plan is to keep the same commercials but re-do the campaign. In the past, the APC has participated in similar campaigns with support ranging from \$15,000 to \$25,000. This year, the BSD is requesting \$20,000 from the parking system because they have decided to hold back some money for a possible spring campaign that would help to get people into town during the construction project. The holiday promotion messages will appear primarily on Channel 7 and on several channels on Comcast.

Motion by Ms. Paskewicz

Seconded by Ms. Champagne to recommend to the City Commission the expenditure of \$20,000 from the Automobile Parking System fund promotion account (Account No. 585-538.001-901.0300) to assist the BSD in creating their proposed 2016 holiday promotional TV campaign.

Motion carried, 6-0.

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Paskewicz, Champagne, Honhart, Kuhne, Peabody, Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: Kalczynski, Krueger

CONSTRUCTION UPDATE

Mr. O'Meara reported there has been a lot of progress the past several weeks on the Park St. Structure. The new lighting project is just about finished with new LED lights in the garage as well as new fluorescents in the stair towers. Next year, in late summer, after construction is done on the street, the plan is to re-paint all the structural steel.

In N. Old Woodward more bolts will be added where the fascia is moving. They are looking to have an outside developer review an RFQ. After that there will be a review at the City Commission level before it goes out for developers to submit their proposals.

MONTHLY FINANCIAL REPORTS

Mr. O'Dell pointed out some of the increase at Chester is because last year there was construction on the street of Chester which limited their revenues. Additional increase is related to overdue balances on validation accounts which have been collected.

The possibility of using valet at Lot 6 was discussed. However, Mr. O'Dell said the benefit would not be enough to justify the cost. Very few cars could be valeted in there because of the way the lot is set up.

MEETING OPEN FOR MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Mr. O'Meara announced that Ms. Peabody is retiring as a member of the committee. He offered thanks for all that she has done and all the time she has given to this effort. Her departure will leave openings on the committee for a property owner and a restaurant owner.

Chief Clemence advised that all of the painting is completed on the new accessible parking space meters. All that is left is signage for the handicap meters. The hope is that everything will be in place by the first week of November. Warning cards will be given out to vehicles that are going by the old rules of free parking and parking at yellow curbs. True enforcement will start after the first of next year.

NEXT REGULARLY SCHEDULED MEETING

November 16, 2016

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:14 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Paul O'Meara
City Engineer