

City of Birmingham  
ADVISORY PARKING COMMITTEE  
REGULAR MEETING

Birmingham City Hall Commission Room  
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan  
Wednesday, September 21, 2016

**MINUTES**

These are the minutes for the Advisory Parking Committee ("APC") regular meeting held on Wednesday, September 21, 2016. The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Lex Kuhne.

**Present:** Chairman Lex Kuhne  
Gayle Champagne  
Anne Honhart  
Steven Kalczynski  
Al Vaitas

**Absent:** Lisa Krueger  
Judith Paskewicz  
Vice-Chairperson Susan Peabody

**BSD:** John Heiney

**SP+ Parking:** Sara Burton  
Jason O'Dell

**Administration:** Austin Fletcher, Asst. City Engineer  
Paul O'Meara, City Engineer  
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

RECOGNITION OF GUESTS (none)

MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF AUGUST 17, 2016

**Motion by Ms. Champagne**  
**Seconded by Mr. Kalczynski to approve the Minutes of the APC Meeting of August 17, 2016 as presented.**

**Motion carried, 5-0.**

**VOICE VOTE:**

Yeas: Champagne, Kalczynski, Honhart, Kuhne, Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: Krueger, Paskewicz, Peabody

**TRAFFIC CONTROL UPGRADES - PHASE 2**

Mr. O'Meara advised that as discussed last month, Phase I of the system-wide traffic control equipment upgrade was implemented at the Chester St. Structure in April of this year. They have since determined that moving forward with a credit card in and out only is not recommended. Not being able to pull a ticket when arriving at the entrance causes consternation for many people. Further, people feel uncomfortable using their credit cards if they will only be parking under two hours for free. With that in mind, installation of traffic control equipment by Skidata that provides tickets but does not take cash is recommended for the other four garages. Customers will be able to either use their credit card or pull a ticket to enter the garage. At the exit a credit or debit card is used to pay.

The additional cost to the system will be about \$182,000 to install the ticket feature in the remaining four structures. There will also be ongoing additional cost to the system to supply tickets in the machines system-wide. Information will be provided at the entrances encouraging longer term parkers to identify themselves with their credit or PINless debit card. Doing so will simplify the exit transaction process. It will also reduce the number of tickets being used each day.

Given ongoing negative reaction to the cashless and ticketless system in place at Chester St., staff has also asked Skidata for a price to retrofit the equipment at Chester St. so that all five garages will operate in the same way.

Mr. O'Dell noted it is not very often that someone does not have a credit card. Parking System debit cards will be on sale by the City. He added that the tickets will cost the City between \$12,000 and \$13,000 per year.

**Motion by Dr. Vaitas**

**Seconded by Mr. Kalczynski to recommend that the City Commission authorize the installation of the Skidata brand traffic control equipment at the four remaining parking structures using equipment that will not take cash, but will offer traditional tickets as a customer identification system. Further, to recommend that the new equipment at the Chester St. Structure be modified to offer customers the option of being identified with tickets instead of the current card only identification system.**

**Motion carried, 5-0.**

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Vaitas, Kalczynski, Champagne, Henke, Honhart

Nays: None

Absent: Krueger, Paskewicz, Peabody

PARK ST. STRUCTURE VALET PARKING PROPOSAL

Mr. O'Meara recalled at the August APC meeting, the committee declined on moving forward with a proposal for a valet assist operation on the roof of the Park St. Parking Structure. The high cost made it unattractive at this time.

After that meeting, staff reviewed its options. SP+ corporate management determined that the local union contract does not speak to the valet position being used; therefore, a different wage can be established. Doing so reduces operating costs.

Further, it appears that there is a basis to reduce the number of hours that the valet staff would be needed. As the summer has progressed, it has become apparent that valet assist is not needed at this structure, or even at the N. Old Woodward Ave. Structure during the months of July and August. Further, valet assist is not being used most Mondays or Fridays.

With the above in mind, SP+ has submitted a new proposal to offer a valet assist operation on the roof of the Park St. Parking Structure. The hours will be approximately 9 a.m. to 6 p.m. Tuesday through Thursday, at an annual cost of \$46,317. If it is found that more hours are needed due to higher demand on the other days of the week, that could be modified as needed.

Operating a valet assist will give the City the option of parking another 50 vehicles in the building, greatly reducing the chance of the structure filling completely. Staff feels this is a worthwhile expense in order to provide the level of service expected in downtown Birmingham.

Mr. O'Dell advised the closest they have come to recently filling Park St. at this point is 25 spaces available; however that could change. Mr. Kalczynski received confirmation this cost was not bid out and he thought that would make sense for something so competitive. Discussion followed that it is more congruent to have the same company operate both garages. Mr. O'Meara said he does not know how the City could get a much cheaper rate. Mr. O'Dell noted

the valet service will be flexible and only used when it is needed, or added to when it is necessary.

**Motion by Ms. Champagne**

**Seconded by Dr. Vaitas that the Advisory Parking Committee recommends that the City Commission approve the SP+ proposal to operate a valet service on Tuesdays through Thursdays at the Park St. Parking Structure roof level wherein:**

- 1. Three valet service staff provided by SP+ will be stationed at the entrance to the roof level from approximately 9 a.m. to 6 p.m.**
- 2. As the lower levels near capacity, all vehicles looking to park on the roof would be required to valet their vehicle, at no additional cost to the customer.**
- 3. The cost to the Auto Parking System is estimated at \$46,317 annually.**
- 4. Valet service hours will be subject to change based on actual need.**

**Motion carried, 5-0.**

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Champagne, Vaitas, Honhart, Kalczynski, Kuhne

Nays: None

Absent: Krueger, Paskewicz, Peabody

AUTHORIZED MONTHLY PERMITS

35001 WOODWARD AVE. TEMPORARY PARKING LOT

Mr. O'Meara reported that in May of this year, the City Commission authorized the sale of 40 monthly permits to the public, using a mirror hang tag system like Parking Lot #6. The permits are sold in three month periods at \$65 per month each. Now that the summer season is over, a survey was conducted this week to measure usage. A new permit period started on September 1, and as of this point, seven of the previous permit holders have not come in to pay for a renewal. If they do not renew by next week, their permits will be offered to others from the Park St. Structure waiting list.

Recent survey results show that the highest number of spaces being used was 27. Given the continued lack of usage, and the desire to make this lot as beneficial as possible, staff now recommends an increase in the authorized number of permits for sale by 15, for a total of 55. If 55 permits are sold, there will be some days when the lot fills. On those days, permit holders can be directed to use the Park St. Structure instead for that day only. While this higher number may result in filling the lot some days, staff feels it is better to have the lot operate closer to capacity than to continue the current underutilization.

Permits will continue to be offered at \$65 pending a change in the monthly permit rate at Park St. If that rate is changed, the rate at this lot should be increased similarly. People from the Park St. waiting list will be contacted first for this opportunity.

**Motion by Ms. Honhart**

**Seconded by Mr. Kalczynski to recommend to the City Commission that the number of authorized permits available for sale at the temporary parking lot being operated at 35001 Woodward Ave. be increased by 15 for a total of 55.**

**Motion carried, 5-0.**

**VOICE VOTE:**

Yeas: Honhart, Kalczynski, Champagne, Honhart, Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: Krueger, Paskewicz, Peabody

**CONSTRUCTION UPDATE**

Mr. O'Meara advised the replacement of all the lights to LED in the Park St. Structure is underway now. The exit signs have been replaced and the lights in the stair towers are now being replaced with fluorescent. The main lights for the ceiling on each deck will soon be shipped. The energy saving projection will be about \$20,0000 per year.

**MONTHLY FINANCIAL REPORTS**

Mr. O'Dell noted the increased revenue is reflecting their increased daily rate.

**MEETING OPEN FOR MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA**

In response to Mr. Kalczynski, Mr. O'Meara said he has heard nothing new about the vacant lot on the SE corner of Maple and Woodward Ave.

**NEXT REGULARLY SCHEDULED MEETING**

October 19, 2016

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:28 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Paul O'Meara  
City Engineer