

City of Birmingham  
ADVISORY PARKING COMMITTEE  
REGULAR MEETING

Birmingham City Hall Commission Room  
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan  
Wednesday, July 12, 2017

**MINUTES**

These are the minutes for the Advisory Parking Committee ("APC") regular meeting held on Wednesday, July 12, 2017. The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Lex Kuhne.

**Present:** Chairman Lex Kuhne  
Gayle Champagne  
Anne Honhart  
Steven Kalczynski  
Judith Paskewicz  
Al Vaitas

**Absent:** Lisa Krueger

**SP+ Parking:** Catherine Burch  
Sara Burton

**Administration:** Austin Fletcher, Asst. City Engineer  
Paul O'Meara, City Engineer  
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

RECOGNITION OF GUESTS (none)

MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF JUNE 7, 2017

**Motion by Ms. Champagne**

**Seconded by Ms. Paskewicz to approve the Minutes of the APC Meeting of June 7, 2017 as presented.**

**Motion carried, 6-0.**

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Champagne, Paskewicz, Honhart, Kalczynski, Kuhne, Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: Krueger

298 S. OLD WOODWARD AVE.  
VALET PARKING REQUEST

Mr. O'Meara advised that the owner of the above property, located at the northwest corner of Brown St., has submitted plans requesting a permit to construct a five-story hotel with two underground levels of private parking. The plans have received Preliminary Site Plan approval from the Planning Board. As a condition of such approval, the Planning Board asked the applicant to appear before the Advisory Parking Committee ("APC") to receive a recommendation relative to the removal of on-street parking, as proposed on their plan.

The applicant is requesting approval to remove five parking spaces to create a permanent valet service at the front door of the new building on S. Old Woodward Ave. The applicant plans to have valet service available for all visitors to the building, whether they are overnight guests, long term residents, patrons at the restaurant, meeting attendees, etc. Vehicles will be taken to the building's proposed Brown St. garage entrance when space permits, and they will be returned to the valet area using the S. Old Woodward garage exit. When space does not permit, the valet drivers will seek other options, such as the Pierce St. Parking Structure. There is precedent for removing parking spaces for valet. The Townsend Hotel pays a fee for the meters and uses eight parking spaces along Merrill St.

With the recent change in the metered parking rate to \$1.50 per hour, the City will now charge \$3,000/year per meter per space.

The applicant is requesting approval for the removal of five spaces, based on the existing parallel parking configuration. The City already committed to changing to angled parking with the reconstruction of Old Woodward Ave. in 2018 as an effort to create twelve on-street parking spaces, up from the existing nine. If the committee is inclined to approve this recommendation, they will need to discuss and consider what the appropriate loss of parking spaces truly is for this site. The Planning Board generally expressed praise for this design, and appears to be in support of the idea to operate a valet station within the public right-of-way. However, they would like the perspective of the APC, before this issue is finalized by the City Commission.

It was discussed that with the Old Woodward Ave. reconstruction the bus stop will be moved north of Merrill St. The existing bumpout will be enlarged to accommodate the bus stop.

Mr. Kalczynski was curious as to how the flow of traffic in front of the hotel would work with 20 or 25 valets and the timing of the lights. The letter from Richard D. Rattner, Attorney, states the valet will benefit the health, safety, and welfare of the community in general. Mr. Kalczynski was not sure how this would be a benefit to the safety of citizens. It was noted that the parking overflow goes to the Pierce St. Structure for both of the hotels.

Mr. O'Meara said when the garage fills the valets will have to figure out other alternatives.

Comments were heard from the public at 7:55 a.m.

Mr. David Berman with the ownership group, Lorient Capital, said they are only required to provide 22 on-site spaces for the residential component, as they are located in the Parking Assessment District. However, they have chosen to build an extra underground level of parking to provide an additional 34 spaces which are not required. That should make up for the seven or eight spaces they are taking out in front of the hotel. In terms of traffic management for the valet operations, they have consulted with the City's Traffic Engineer and have worked out a plan that he is comfortable with. With regard to overflow in the garage, they plan to use multiple structures, as they are centrally located within the City. In addition, they have submitted a plan to the City for when there are large events. They will work with the Police Dept. in order to coordinate how to best manage the additional traffic. Most of their events will occur in the evening or on weekends so they are using spaces when others are not.

In response to the Chairman, Mr. Berman stated that 40 spaces in the private lot on their property will be going away. No on-site parking will be provided for employees of the hotel. Mr. Michael Kitchen, VP of Development and Acquisitions for Aperia Hotels, operator of the hotel, noted their employees will usually arrive by car pool or public transit. If the project was an office use, it would require a lot more parking.

Ms. Gail McGregor, Attorney with Williams, Williams, Rattner & Plunkett, P.C., 380 N. Old Woodward Ave., stated this will be a smooth operation. The garage will be utilized as part of the staging for the valet. Curbside valet will help to reduce congestion on S. Old Woodward at the intersection. Further, valet is a very safe way to accommodate arrivals and departures.

Mr. Kitchen walked the committee through how the traffic will work in terms of flow. There is an entrance on one side of the garage and departure from the other side. Short stays can be staged along the ramp and overspill will go into the City parking structures.

Ms. Champagne observed the valet overcomes any loss of parking spaces because vehicles are moved off the street and down below.

Ms. Kalczynski indicated he struggles with the fact there is a very high demand for spaces, and there are not enough spaces right now to fit that demand. Ms. McGregor commented they have submitted a major event plan to the City that outlines workable ways to prevent significant traffic problems on the street. Mr. Kitchen added if they have a large event they will notify the City and the Police Dept. They have a unique ambassador program where every one of the front house staff is cross-trained to park cars in case there is a huge influx of guests arriving at one time.

Mr. Berman noted they have developed a traffic and parking plan with the City and Police Dept. that has been approved and accepted by them. As they get closer to construction additional options will be explored for parking in lots that are not filled in evenings or on weekends.

Ms. Paskewicz observed the impact on parking is not only about spaces for valet; it is about other needs for this kind of facility such as making room for busses.

The chairman commented this has been an under-utilized piece of real estate in Birmingham and to him this seems to be a viable usage. In the future, parking shortages will be reduced with the onset of self-driving cars and increased use of Uber.

Mr. Berman reiterated they are creating more spaces for the City with this project, rather than removing them. However, the chairman pointed out they are also creating a lot more dense usage.

Mr. Kalczynski expressed his desire to see the traffic and parking management plan that was submitted to the City before the committee votes on this matter. He is looking for information about how the traffic flow will happen.

Ms. Champagne motioned to recommend the removal of eight on-street parking spaces at 298 S. Old Woodward Ave. to allow for the operation of a valet service by the adjacent property owner, in exchange for an annual payment of \$24,000 (at \$3,000 per meter) to be charged annually once the adjacent hotel is open for business. However, the motion died for lack of a second.

After lengthy discussion, the committee concluded they need more information with regard to the traffic flow. After studying the traffic and parking management plan they will do their best to move the applicant's request forward at the next meeting.

## CITY-WIDE MASTER PLAN UPDATE

Mr. O'Meara advised there has been no update to the City-wide Master Plan since it was written in 1980. Many subsequent plans have studied specific parts of the City, but nothing has been comprehensive.

The City Commission has directed the Planning Dept. staff to budget and prepare for this effort during the coming fiscal year. The Planning Dept. is now in the process of writing a Request for Proposals so that a planning consultant can be selected to write a Master Plan. At this time, the APC is being asked to provide various parking system questions of concern to the committee that could be studied further as a part of the process for preparing a Master Plan.

Committee members came up with the following:

- Consider the future of ride sharing, autonomous vehicles and mass transit;
- Should the Parking Assessment District be restructured so that perhaps future expansion of buildings pay a higher price;
- Should some streets be made one way to allow afor better flow of traffic;
- Should parking for the Triangle District and Rail District fall into separate assessment districts and be under the purview of this committee;
- Should there be a written standard relative to the maximum number of dining decks that can be installed per block;
- Should hourly rates be dynamic depending on daily changes in demand both on the street and in the structures;
- Proivde ideas on how to handle parking demand when the N. Old Woodward structure is torn down;
- Should the new structure be designed in such a way that it could be transitioned to another use such in the future if demand for parking declines;
- Development of a policy for electric charging stations in the Central Business District.

## CONSTRUCTION UPDATE

### *Park St. Structure Painting Project*

Work began June 29 on the first phase of this project. A relatively small portion of Levels 4 and 5 are closed presently to complete Phase 1 work. SP+ is now operating a rooftop valet five days a week to ensure that the structure remains open to the public as much as possible. They are also ready at N. Old Woodward in case there is an overflow. Ms. Burton reported the Park St. structure has been filling every day this week and they have been having valet on the roof. There is

an operating valet on the roof at Chester as well. N. Old Woodward has not been filling.

### MONTHLY FINANCIAL REPORTS

Ms. Burton indicated everything is going well and revenue is up.

### MEETING OPEN FOR MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Dr. Vaitas reported that he has heard some complaints about the CivicSmart parking meters. When someone parks for one hour on a four hour time limit meter and they add additional coins, the meter will zero out whatever time is left and start over. Mr. O'Meara indicated that he would look into this issue.

Ms. Paskewicz noted that ParkMobil charges a fee/use. With the new meters, there is no fee if one simply uses their card directly.

Chairman Kuhne asked if there is a way to make the readers in the garages more sensitive. People with low rise sport cars are having problems. Ms. Burch responded they could look at that. The Chairman further inquired if the turn radius could be changed at Peabody. Because of the turn people have to come super close to the reader. But they don't want to scrape the left rims of their car on the cement. This could happen because the reader is over the cement. Ms. Burch indicated the turning radius could be increased without having to touch the reader. Mr. O'Meara said they can look into that when they plan their next rehabilitation project next year.

### NEXT REGULARLY SCHEDULED MEETING

August 2, 2017

### ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:25 a.m.

---

City Engineer Paul O'Meara