

City of Birmingham
ADVISORY PARKING COMMITTEE
REGULAR MEETING

Birmingham City Hall Commission Room
151 Martin, Birmingham, Michigan
Wednesday, March 7, 2018

MINUTES

These are the minutes of the Advisory Parking Committee ("APC") regular meeting held on Wednesday March 7, 2018. The meeting was called to order at 7:30 a.m. by Chairman Al Vaitas.

Present: Chairman Al Vaitas
Vice-Chairperson Gayle Champagne
Anne Honhart (arrived at 7:36 a.m.)
Steven Kalczynski
Lisa Krueger
Judith Paskiewicz

Absent: None

SP+ Parking: Catherine Burch
Sara Burton
Jay O'Dell

BSD: Ingrid Tighe, Executive Director

Administration: Austin Fletcher, Asst. City Engineer
Tiffany Gunter, Asst. City Manager
Paul O'Meara, City Engineer
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

RECOGNITION OF GUESTS (none)

MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF FEBRUARY 7, 2018

Motion by Ms. Champagne
Seconded by Ms. Krueger to accept the Minutes of February 7, 2018 as presented.

Motion carried, 5-0.

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Champagne, Krueger, Kalczynski, Paskiewicz, Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: Honhart

PUBLIC HEARING

PARKING LOT #6 REHABILITATION/EXPANSION

The public hearing opened at 7:35 p.m.

After reviewing the current conditions with an engineering consultant, Hubbell Roth & Clark ("HRC"), the following three options have been prepared in conceptual plan format, with cost estimates attached:

OPTION 1 – RESURFACE EXISTING LOT

The plan shows the areas of the lot that have not been repaved in 20 years. (The remainder of the area was repaved last year as a part of an Oakland County sewer relocation project.) It is envisioned that the top two inches of asphalt would be removed and replaced, with other various base repair work as needed. In order to enhance the area some, arborvitae are proposed to be installed along the east edge of the lot, between the existing mature evergreen trees. Such a project would give the entire lot a new fresh look, but would do nothing to enhance its capacity or storm water quality. The engineer's estimate for this work, including a contingency, is \$242,000.

OPTION 2 – PROVIDE MINOR EXPANSION TO EAST, AND RESURFACE EXISTING LOT

The plan depicts the small 4 ft. wide expansion to the east. The expansion would attempt to save the existing evergreen trees to the east, as well as supplement them with new arborvitae, as in Option 1. The curb relocation would allow for an increase in capacity by 14 parking spaces, or an expansion of 10%. Such a project would give the entire lot a new fresh look. It would do nothing to enhance its storm water quality. The engineer's estimate, including a contingency, is almost \$290,000. During the study of this area, the City's forestry consultant has acknowledged that the existing evergreen trees planted along the east edge of the lot have passed their prime and several have been removed already through the intervening years. Of the ones that remain, several are diseased and in decline, although others are still strong. Undertaking this option would likely

result in damaging the root structure of some of the trees, which may result in further losses in the coming years.

OPTION 3 – PROVIDE GREATER EXPANSION TO THE EAST, PROVIDE STORM WATER QUALITY IMPROVEMENTS, AND RESURFACE EXISTING LOT

Considering the current status of the adjacent evergreen trees, the third plan has proposed their removal, and depicts a 20 ft. expansion to the east, thereby accommodating an expansion of 34 parking spaces. To improve upon the aesthetics and storm water quality of the lot, a bioswale has been proposed behind the east curb edge. The bioswale would be enhanced with plantings that would work as a filter to stop pollutants coming off the lot before they enter the river. The new curb would have several openings to allow storm water to flow into the bioswale. In the lowest area, at the southeast corner, the existing concrete spillway would be removed in favor of a stone lined sedimentation basin. The basin would allow all of the storm water to flow very slowly into the river, allowing pollutants and sediment to drop out of the water before entering the river. Given the close proximity to the river, and the work within the floodplain, the design would have to be approved by the Michigan Dept. of Environmental Quality ("MDEQ"). If done correctly, we assume the MDEQ would endorse this voluntary effort to improve the storm drainage design of an existing parking lot. If this design moves forward, a closer look at the vegetation in the area is recommended. Undesirable or invasive species could be removed and replaced with more desirable plantings that could provide an improved aesthetic and screening effect for the adjacent residential area. Such a project would provide improvements to the lot in many ways, and would also improve the capacity of the lot by 24%. The total cost of this option, including contingency, is estimated at almost \$500,000.

If Option 3 is elected, there is a significant expenditure proposed that can be categorized as an environmental improvement. Currently unfiltered storm water that picks up oil and dirt from the lot is directed straight into the Rouge River. By installing a bioswale and settling basin, the storm water would flow slower and be filtered before entering the river. Such an improvement would qualify for consideration of a grant.

Two grant opportunities are identified by our engineer, HRC. In general terms, it is estimated that the cost of the environmental improvements totals \$163,000. If the City receives a grant of 75% of this amount, a savings to the parking system of about \$100,000 could be accomplished. Acquiring the grant would likely result in a delay of an additional year, moving the project to 2020 construction. Delaying the work until 2020 is problematic not only in terms of not bringing any

relief to the parking issues in this area, but it also would then conflict with the planned Maple Rd. Paving Project planned downtown during the same time.

Responding to Ms. Champagne, Mr. O'Meara said this would be an early 2019 project if they do not attempt to get the grant. There is a nominal cost to apply for the grant. They are looking at gaining about \$160,000 with the grant that would just cover the environmental costs and not the paving. Getting the grant would not be a sure thing. The least disruption to the community would be to build the whole project at once.

Mr. O'Meara went on to describe how construction would proceed with the least disturbance to the public and to the Farmer's Market.

Mr. Jamie Burton, Environmental Engineer from HRC, said they will pick Michigan native plants for the bioswale that will slow the water down and take up the nutrients. The goal will be for long-term low maintenance.

Mr. O'Meara verified for Mr. Kalczynski that a parking space in a structure costs \$25,000 to \$30,000. Chairman Vaitas compared that cost with how much a space would be using Option 3, which is about \$6,500.

Mr. O'Meara responded to Dr. Paskiewicz's question about adding in the picnic tables and seating from the Farmer's Market if Option 3 proceeds. He explained they could curve the swale around so that it leaves green space behind the curb and creates seating areas. It was mentioned that the arborvitae would block headlights from residences to the east.

The Chairman took comments from the audience.

Mr. Joe Finessi, business owner in the area, said the payback on \$6,500 would be about three years or less. Therefore, it makes sense to go through with it.

Haley is a manager for Luigi Bruni at the north end of Old Woodward Ave. They have 32 employees and over half have parking passes for Lot #6, but a majority of the time they have to pay for parking in other spots in addition to paying for their pass. Their 4,000 sq. ft. business is being impacted the most. The lot is in shambles with many potholes and it is not appropriate for either consumers or for their staff to park. She thought it is imperative that the lot gets done sooner rather than later.

Mr. Brian Najor, Najor Companies, 600 N. Old Woodward Ave. said they own 600 through 640 N. Old Woodward Ave. They think the lot is in immediate need of repair with its many potholes and distress cracks. The cost for a space is pretty cheap compared to what a space in a structure costs. The ability to park

on the side streets has been taken away from business owners because of resident complaints. Therefore they need to utilize the opportunity to get about 34 more spots.

Ms. Tonia Schrem spoke to represent one of the businesses in the 600-620 Building. She stated they need to see some urgency from the Parking Committee. They are losing business because their clients cannot find a place to park and end up turning around and leaving.

Mr. Joe Bongiovanni, said he represents three businesses, Market, Luxe Bar and Grille, and Salvatore Scaloppini; but also is a future homeowner at 680 Brookside. The employee parking element of this discussion is vital. As far as they are concerned as business people, all of the spots near their restaurants are expected to be for customers. He thought some form of a shuttle should be set up that would be beneficial to them.

Ms. Tammy Marinella represented 800 N. Old Woodward, Brogan and Partners. They have 27 employees and they spend \$5,800/quarter for parking. They have 19 passes but ten of their employees have to use the meter parking which doubled in price in the last six months. The City will make up the \$6,500/space with just one company's parking pass expense.

Ms. Helen Fratell, the owner of Birmingham Wine, said she is one person with no employees and can't get a parking pass. If she pays for meter parking she can't pay her rent at the end of the month. So any spots would be a huge help.

Ms. Carolyn Butcher said she works for Norm Ziegelman Architects at 800 N. Old Woodward Ave. They are desperate for parking. There are no spots. With the construction next door they have lost five spots. It's not just employees trying to park, now there are construction workers as well.

Mr. Robert Greenstone from Greenstone Jewelers on 430 N. Old Woodward Ave. pointed out that Tuesday through Friday every street metered space is used from 11:30 a.m. to 2:30 p.m. all the way to Euclid and beyond. Wednesday through Friday Lot #6 is completely jammed. With the Brookside Condominium construction along N. Old Woodward Ave. they have lost 16 street spaces on the west side of N. Old Woodward Ave. and at least an equal number on the surface lot connected to the N. Old Woodward Parking Structure. All of the additional spaces that are potentially available would be most welcomed by the patrons of the businesses.

Mr. Marvin Acho from One Source, 600 N. Old Woodward Ave., said he has had his parking pass for about eight years. It has gotten more and more frustrating for him every Wednesday, Thursday, and Friday because it is too tough to find a

parking spot from 11 a.m. to 2:30 p.m. He thought the extra parking spots would help.

Ms. Kay Huberty, Certified Nutritional Consultant in private practice at 600 N. Old Woodward Ave. said her patients cannot get in for their health care appointments because they cannot find parking. She strongly endorsed Option 3 and the possibility of more parking for clients.

Mr. Bongiovanni said their three restaurants will wholeheartedly try to maneuver their employees to off-site shuttle lots if the cost is zero or minimal compared to parking in the garage or on-street.

Ms. Gunter stated that the focus of the parking consultant that they selected concerns the demand and supply issues that have come up today. Internally, even without the consultant's help, they have been looking at lots that could potentially be used to expand parking capacity. As part of their parking study they will be working through the BSD and with the merchants to survey and find out the likelihood of daily parkers taking advantage of that option.

Ms. Honhart noted they have offered this before to companies in Birmingham and the companies have not shown interest. Yet, people still expect the City to keep supplying more and more parking spaces.

Haley made one additional comment. She does not think their business is opposed to the shuttle idea. However it is not convenient for most of their staff who leave and come back at various times of the day. Instead of some of the other things that are going on in the City this parking lot is important and imperative.

Motion by Ms. Krueger

Seconded by Ms. Champagne that the APC recommends that the City Commission authorize the restoration of Parking Lot #6, using Option #3.

Motion carried, 6-0.

ROLLCALL VOTE:

Yeas: Krueger, Champagne, Honhart, Kalczynski, Paskiewicz, Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: None

298 S. OLD WOODWARD AVE.
DAXTON HOTEL VALET PARKING PROPOSAL

Mr. O'Meara offered background. A five-story hotel is proposed for the northwest corner of S. Old Woodward Ave. and E. Brown St., the Daxton Hotel. Last July and August, the APC approved a recommendation to remove all of the metered parking in front of the property in order to make space for a valet parking zone.

At their meeting on October 16, 2017, the City Commission did not approve the recommendation. The applicant was asked to study moving the valet to Brown St., and if necessary, reduce the size of the valet on Old Woodward Ave. With the above in mind, the applicant has worked with their traffic engineering team to develop a computer model to demonstrate what would happen if the valet operation was moved to Brown St. Secondly, the applicant is now on record indicating that they can make the valet operation work with two metered parking spaces being installed just south of the proposed Old Woodward Ave. garage exit, with the provision that during times of peak occupancy, the meters could be bagged and taken out of service for additional valet staging area. Since the original proposal called for the removal of eight metered parking spaces, this new proposal is asking for the removal of just six metered parking spaces.

The City Commission has set the new rate per meter at \$5,400/year, which is calculated by using \$18/day for 300 days per year. The number of days per year reflects the fact that parking is not charged on Sundays, nor on legal holidays, which average 13 per year.

Mr. Rick Rattner, Attorney, 380 N. Old Woodward Ave., introduced Mr. Mike Darga, Traffic Engineer from Giffels Webster; Mr. Matt Schwan from Giffels Webster; and Mr. David Berman, 102 Pierce St., representing the ownership group. Mr. Rattner asked that Mr. Kalczynski recuse himself from hearing this matter, but the request was refused by the Chairman.

Mr. Rattner indicated their model studies have shown that if they use Brown St. for valet service it would block the street all the way down to Pierce. The next thing they did was to see if they could cut down on the number of spaces on S. Old Woodward Ave. being used for regular valet parking. Therefore they added a second level of underground parking, which gave them a total of 56 spaces, of which 29 are required because of the residential floor. They would be used as storage space for valet. So they have done everything they can to provide more parking for the City. For special events they would bag two spaces on Brown St. for the valet.

Therefore their current reduced request in the new configuration when S. Old Woodward Ave. is redone is for six angled parking spaces along S. Old Woodward Ave. and the ability to bag two spaces for special events. Mr. Darga gave a presentation showing on the screen proposed traffic circulation patterns in and out of the parking structure during an event. Mr. Rattner hoped the

committee would approve their reduced request for valet. It is the minimal, they think, that they can operate with and not interfere with traffic in the City.

Mr. Kalczynski noted that on Merrill and on Townsend St. there is a lot of congestion even with two or three available spaces for the Townsend valet. So, imagine the amount of congestion that will be caused by having valet on one of the main thoroughfares in town. As a result, he felt there has to be a better solution for S. Old Woodward Ave. He sees the potential for a lot of clogged traffic. Mr. Rattner replied the way valets park cars they can accommodate a total of 76 to 80 vehicles in the Daxton garage. Further, the hotel is providing off-street parking for the retailers in the City. Also, their valet never leaves the garage and blocks S. Old Woodward Ave.

Ms. Honhart inquired where the hotel employees will park. Mr. David Berman believed many of the hotel workers will use public transportation. Secondly, they recently secured 200 spaces in the Birmingham Place parking structure, which they own, where hotel employees can park.

Mr. Kalczynski commented the amount of additional parking spaces, although commendable, that will be in the new boutique hotel doesn't necessarily talk about the issue at hand, which is the clogging of the main artery of the City of Birmingham.

Mr. Berman concluded they have completed the additional work that the City requested, evaluated it, and think that it will not cause any major traffic congestion. Also, looking at the highest and best use for that site, they could have built an office building. That office building would have a zero parking requirement because it is in the Parking Assessment District. The hotel has provided 54 actual spaces, up to 80 with valet, and they are using them at off-peak times from when the office workers do not need them. In conclusion, they have done everything they can, going above and beyond what is required to help solve the City's parking problem.

There were no comments from the public at 8:55 a.m.

Motion by Ms. Champagne

Seconded by Ms. Krueger to recommend to the City Commission the removal of six metered on-street parking spaces at 298 S. Old Woodward Ave. to allow for the operation of a valet service by the adjacent property owner, in exchange for an annual payment of \$32,400 (at \$5,400/meter) to be charged annually.

Motion carried, 5-1.

VOICE VOTE:

Yeas: Champagne, Krueger, Honhart, Paskiewicz, Vaitas

Nays: Kalczynski

Absent: None

PERMIT RULE CHANGE AND
TRANSIENT PARKING IN STRUCTURES

Ms. Gunter advised that in the third week of March 2018, the City will undergo a major reconstruction of Old Woodward Ave. and will temporarily remove 130 on-street parking spaces. In an effort to mitigate the impact on our transient parkers and ensure full utilization of the available rooftop valet assist. Ms. Gunter summarized the findings of staff and discussed the rationale for the recommendation. Ms. Gunter noted that the goal is to maximize availability of the first level parking spaces within the decks for transient parkers and maximize utilization of the roof-top valet assist. She noted that, if the recommendations were approved that the CBD could realize an increased capacity of 250 parking spaces within the existing structures and eliminate long-term parking in the prime parking spaces, located on the first floors of each structure.

- Part 1 of the recommendation involves a change in strategy for the structures that will encourage greater turnover of parking spaces in the lower levels of the structure. Staff recommends that all garages will move away from the No Parking between 7 a.m. and 9 a.m. or 7 a.m. and 10 a.m. and replace those signs with 3 hour maximum parking signs that exclude monthly permit holders from parking in these restricted spaces.
- Part II of the recommendation involves a modification to the existing permit rules that require the use of rooftop valet assist for monthly permit parkers when the structure is full. This change would be rolled out along with the parking signage suggestions and staff recommends changing the language on the monthly parking permit rules. Number 5 on the rules currently states the following:

5. This permit authorizes parking only in designated areas on a first-come first-serve basis. Designated areas are striped with yellow lines. If no space is available in your designated area you may park in any available space in the structure. If the structure is full, you may park in designated areas in any other City Parking Structure (not surfaces lots).

To have the monthly parkers fully utilize their designated space in each structure Staff would like to change the language to the following:

5. This permit authorizes parking only in designated areas on a first-come first-serve basis. If all available spaces are full, you are required to use the rooftop valet service (if available) at no extra

fee. If the rooftop valet is unavailable, you may park in designated areas in any other City Parking Structure. Parking spaces marked with a 3 hour time limit, as well as any parking meters on streets and surface lots, do not qualify as monthly parking spaces at any time. Any monthly parker not utilizing the rooftop valet, when available, will be required to pay the daily rate at any other City Structure (except for permit holders at the Peabody structure, where valet assist is not available).

Ms. Gunter stated that this recommendation will significantly increase the likelihood that parking spaces are available for transient parkers and will help promote turnover when coupled with the time restrictions. Consistent and similar signage, enforcement, and change of rules in all the structures will give a more positive impression to all parkers.

Ms. Gunter noted that, If approved, staff will begin an intense communication push with our monthly permit holders. The total cost to implement these changes in the first three months is estimated to be \$33,768 through the remainder of this current fiscal year. (Signage is estimated at \$5,760 and enforcement costs for three months totaling \$28,008.) After three months, the cost to maintain enforcement would be \$3,112.

Staff will evaluate the performance of the changes over the four month period and Ms. Gunter indicated that this may not be a temporary change. They hope that at the conclusion of the Old Woodward Ave. reconstruction we gain some flexibility in our permitting ability to reduce the wait list.

Mr. O'Dell said to make sure people are only parking for three hours the tires will be tracked electronically by the location of the tire stem. Also they will track license plate numbers through their hand-held system to ensure the monthly parkers are not utilizing those lower spaces. Violators could lose their monthly pass. Transient parkers who ignore the three-hour rule could get a ticket. He noted for Dr. Paskiewicz that the turnaround time for retrieving a car from the valet is only a couple of minutes.

Mr. O'Meara pointed out that after the construction, keeping the valet there would give them the ability to start selling more monthly passes.

Dr. Paskiewicz observed that people who are buying a permit will have full knowledge that they will need to valet park. That may push some people to find a different solution.

Motion by Ms. Honhart

Seconded by Ms. Champagne that the Advisory Parking Committee recommends that the City Commission approves \$33,768 to support the implementation of the restricted 3-hour parking/no monthly parking signage at all of the existing parking structures and modification of the existing permit rules to require monthly permit holders to utilize the rooftop valet assist option with an ongoing enforcement cost of \$3,112 per month.

Amended by Ms. Krueger (and accepted by makers of the motion) to include this recommendation through the end of the Old Woodward Ave. construction and have it re-evaluated for a long-term solution.

Motion carried, 6-0.

ROLLCALL VOTE:

Yeas: Honhart, Champagne, Kalczynski, Krueger, Paskiewicz, Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: None

APC SUPPORT FOR CONSTRUCTION MARKETING

Ms. Gunter recalled at the February 7 APC meeting the committee requested additional information from the Birmingham Shopping District ("BSD") to support the request for additional funding to market available parking options during the period that will involve the reconstruction of Old Woodward Ave. The APC requested a specific timeframe for the marketing campaign and details concerning the total media buy. The BSD has provided the requested detail and is seeking a recommendation to approve \$60,000 in funding support.

Ms. Tighe stated the BSD will be running a multi-faceted marketing campaign to promote the downtown shopping, dining and spa experience during the Old Woodward reconstruction project. The BSD will highlight the downtown through TV, radio, magazine, newspaper, and through social media ads promoting the popular "2 Hours Free Parking in the Decks" program and free valet parking available during the construction period from April to August 1.

The BSD has committed a total of \$100,000 for construction related activities. They are requesting the Advisory Parking Committee to approve a \$60,000 commitment from the parking fund to support the marketing campaign.

In addition, wayfinding signs will be printed that show where the valet parking stations are located. Strategic ads will be input into facebook, snap chat and instagram that target consumers in the retail trade area.

Motion by Dr. Paskiewicz

Seconded by Mr. Kalczyński that the Advisory Parking Committee recommends a one-time expenditure of \$60,000 in support of the BSD reconstruction marketing campaign.

Motion carried, 6-0.

ROLLCALL VOTE:

Yeas: Paskiewicz, Kalczyński, Champagne, Honhart, Krueger, Vaitas

Nays: None

Absent: None

MONTHLY FINANCIAL REPORTS

Mr. O'Dell stated that the financials look good.

MEETING OPEN FOR MATTERS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Ms. Gunter provided an update on Staff's first meeting with the Nelson/Nygaard team, the new parking consultant. The purpose of the meeting was to make sure they have a good understanding of the existing conditions and the needs. It is anticipated that next month they will be in front of this committee to report their findings thus far. At the merchant meeting tomorrow a brief survey will be completed so the consultants can get feedback and understand some of the challenges.

Ms. Honhart described experience she has had in the parking structures because the display says "reinsert card" and there is a delay in the gate going up. Mr. O'Dell explained there is a slight delay because the machine encrypts credit card information to keep it safe and then sends the signal to raise the gate. He will check into the message about reinserting the card. They are working through signage to get people to do things in the proper way in order to speed things up.

Further responding to Ms. Honhart, Mr. O'Dell said when someone no longer needs their parking pass it is not allowed for them to give the pass to someone else. .

NEXT REGULARLY SCHEDULED MEETING

April 4, 2018

ADJOURNMENT

No further business being evident, the Chairman adjourned the meeting at 9:30 a.m.

City Engineer Paul O'Meara