

**CITY OF BIRMINGHAM
BOARD OF ETHICS AGENDA
November 21, 2022
MUNICIPAL BUILDING, 151 MARTIN
10:00 AM**

I. CALL TO ORDER

James Robb, Chairperson

II. ROLL CALL

Alexandria Bingham, City Clerk

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of minutes of September 22, 2022

IV. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

V. NEW BUSINESS

- A. Christal Phillips, Executive Director of the Board of Ethics for the City of Detroit – Discussion regarding suggested topics and activities for an Ethics Conference in Downtown Detroit
- B. Review of the Ethics Ordinance and Board Rules of Procedure

VI. PUBLIC COMMENT

VII. ADJOURN

Should you wish to participate, you are invited to attend the meeting in person or virtually through ZOOM: <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/99656852194> Meeting ID: 996 5685 2194
You may also present your written statement to the Board of Ethics, City of Birmingham, 151 Martin Street, P.O. Box 3001, Birmingham, Michigan 48012-3001 prior to the meeting.

NOTICE: Individuals requiring accommodations, such as mobility, visual, hearing, interpreter or other assistance, for effective participation in this meeting should contact the City Clerk's Office at (248) 530-1880 (voice), or (248) 644-5115 (TDD) at least one day in advance to request mobility, visual, hearing or other assistance.

Las personas que requieren alojamiento, tales como servicios de interpretación, la participación efectiva en esta reunión deben ponerse en contacto con la Oficina del Secretario Municipal al (248) 530-1880 por lo menos el día antes de la reunión pública. (Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964).

I, Alexandria Bingham, the duly appointed City Clerk for the City of Birmingham, certify this meeting notice was posted at all four entrances into the Municipal Building, and to www.bhamgov.org on September 14, 2022.

Alexandria Bingham

**City of Birmingham
Board of Ethics Minutes
September 22, 2022
151 Martin, Birmingham**

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Robb called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

II. ROLL CALL

Present: James Robb, Chair
John Schrot, Board Member
Sophie Fierro-Share, Board Member

Absent: None

Administration: City Manager Markus, City Clerk Bingham, City Attorney Kucharek

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

MOTION: Motion by Mr. Schrot, seconded by Ms. Fierro-Share:
To approve the minutes of August 16, 2022 as submitted.

VOICE VOTE: Ayes, Chair Robb
Mr. Schrot
Ms. Fierro-Share
Nays, None

Chair Robb commended the City Clerk's Staff on the minutes.

IV. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

V. NEW BUSINESS

- A. Review and approval of the draft Advisory Opinion 2022-01 – Requested by City Manager Thomas M. Markus Re. Samuel Oh on the Triangle District Corridor Improvement Authority

The Chair thanked Mr. Schrot for drafting the opinion. He invited Mr. Schrot to present the opinion prior to comment from the Board.

The Board then discussed updates to the opinion. CC Bingham integrated the updates into the opinion during the discussion. All updates were added by Board consensus.

MOTION: Motion by Chair Robb, seconded by Ms. Fierro-Share:
To adopt the opinion as revised.



MEMORANDUM

City Clerk's Office

DATE: November 14, 2022

TO: Board of Ethics

FROM: Alexandria Bingham, City Clerk

SUBJECT: Christal Phillips, Executive Director of the Board of Ethics for the City of Detroit – Discussion on topics or activities for local ethics boards to integrate into an ethics conference in Downtown Detroit

INTRODUCTION:

Executive Director Phillips reached out to the city of Birmingham in early October 2022 regarding an opportunity to collaborate on topics and activities for an ethics conference to be held in Downtown Detroit this spring. The city clerk was advised by City Manager Markus, City Attorney Kucharek and Ethics Board Chairperson Robb to coordinate a date for the ethics board to discuss the matter in a public meeting.



MEMORANDUM

City Clerk's Office

DATE: November 14, 2022

TO: Board of Ethics

FROM: Alexandria Bingham, City Clerk

SUBJECT: Review of the Ethics Code and Procedural Rules

INTRODUCTION:

Near the conclusion of the last Board of Ethics meeting held on September 22, 2022 the board came to a consensus regarding setting some time aside to review the current city code pertaining to ethics and the procedural rules in place for the Board of Ethics.

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Birmingham City Code – Article IX. – Ethics
2. Board of Ethics Procedural Rules
3. Affidavit and Disclosure Statement
4. Advisory Opinion Request Form
5. Ethics Complaint Form

ARTICLE IX. - ETHICS

Footnotes:

--- (9) ---

Editor's note— Ord. No. 1810, adopted May 19, 2003, states that the provisions of this article shall become effective July 21, 2003.

Sec. 2-320. - Public policy.

Public office and employment are public trusts. For government to operate properly, each city official, employee, or advisor must earn and honor the public trust by integrity and conduct.

The city hereby declares that all city officials and employees must avoid conflicts between their private interests and the public interest. Public officials and employees must:

- (1) Be independent, impartial and responsible to the people;
- (2) Make governmental decisions and policy in the proper governmental channels;
- (3) Not use public office for personal gain.

To enhance public trust, the city must provide its officials and employees with adequate guidelines for separating their roles as private citizens from their roles as public servants.

This Code sets minimum standards of ethical conduct for all city officials and employees, elected or appointed, paid or unpaid. It proscribes actions incompatible with the public interest and directs disclosure of private financial or other interests in matters affecting the city.

(Ord. No. 1805, 4-28-03; Ord. No. 1810, 5-19-03; Ord. No. 1819, 1-12-04)

Sec. 2-321. - Responsibilities of public office.

City officials and employees are bound to uphold the Constitution of the United States and the Constitution of the State and to carry out impartially and comply with the laws of the nation, state, and the city. City officials and employees must not exceed their authority or breach the law or ask others to do so. City officials and employees are bound to observe in their official acts the highest standards of ethical conduct and to discharge the duties of their offices faithfully, regardless of personal consideration, recognizing that their official conduct should be above reproach.

All city officials and employees shall safeguard public confidence by being honest, fair and respectful of all persons and property with whom they have contact, by maintaining non-partisanship in all official acts, and by avoiding official conduct which may tend to undermine respect for city officials and employees and for the city as an institution.

(Ord. No. 1805, 4-28-03; Ord. No. 1810, 5-19-03; Ord. No. 1819, 1-12-04; Ord. No. 2177, 3-28-16)

Sec. 2-322. - Definitions.

City official or employee means a person elected, appointed or otherwise serving in any capacity with the city in any position established by the City Charter or by city ordinance which involves the exercise of a public power, trust or duty. The term includes all officials and employees of the city, whether or not they receive compensation, including consultants and persons who serve on advisory boards and commissions. The term does not include election inspectors and student representatives appointed to city boards or commissions.

Consultant means a person who gives professional advice or services regarding matters in the field of his or her special knowledge or training.

Compensation means any money, property, thing of value or benefit conferred upon or received by any person in return for services rendered or to be rendered to himself or herself or any other party.

Financial interest means any interest in money, property or thing of value or benefit.

Immediate family means a city official or employee, his or her spouse, parents or children.

Official duties or *official action* means a decision, recommendation, approval, disapproval or other action or failure to act, which involves the use of discretionary authority.

Personal interest means an interest arising from blood or marriage relationships or any business association.

Private gain means any interest or benefit, in any form, received by a city employee or official.

Substantial shall mean considerable in quantity or significantly great.

(Ord. No. 1805, 4-28-03; Ord. No. 1810, 5-19-03; Ord. No. 1819, 1-12-04)

Sec. 2-323. - Intention of code.

It is the intention of section 2-324 below that city officials and employees avoid any action, whether or not specifically prohibited by section 2-324, which might result in, or create the appearance of:

- (1) Using public employment or office for private gain;
- (2) Giving or accepting preferential treatment, including the use of city property or information, to or from any organization or person;
- (3) Losing complete independence or impartiality of action;
- (4) Making a city decision outside official channels; or
- (5) Affecting adversely the confidence of the public or the integrity of the city government.

The code of ethics is intended to be preventative and not punitive. It should not be construed to interfere with or abrogate in any way the provisions of any federal or state statutes, the City Charter, the city ordinances, or any rights and/or remedies guaranteed under a collective bargaining agreement.

This declaration of policy is not intended to apply to contributions to political campaigns, which are governed by state law.

(Ord. No. 1805, 4-28-03; Ord. No. 1810, 5-19-03; Ord. No. 1819, 1-12-04)

Sec. 2-324. - Promulgation.

(a) *Conflict of interest—General.*

- (1) No official or employee of the city shall divulge to any unauthorized person, confidential information acquired in the course of employment in advance of the time prescribed for its authorized release to the public.
- (2) No official or employee of the city shall represent his or her personal opinion as that of the city.
- (3) Every official or employee of the city shall use personnel resources, property and funds under his or her

official care and control solely in accordance with prescribed constitutional, statutory and regulatory procedures and not for personal gain or benefit.

- (4) No official or employee of the city shall directly or indirectly, solicit or accept any gift or loan of money, goods, services or other thing of value for the benefit of any person or organization, other than the city, which tends to influence the manner in which the official or employee or any other official or employee performs his or her official duties.

Gratuities do not include fees for speeches or published works on legislative subjects and, except in connection therewith reimbursement for expenses for actual expenditures for travel, and reasonable subsistence, for which no payment or reimbursement is made by the city, invitations to such events as ground breakings, grand openings, charitable or civic events, or inconsequential gifts from established friends.

- (5) No official or employee of the city shall engage in a business transaction in which he or she may profit because of his or her official position or authority or benefit financially from confidential information which he or she has obtained or may obtain by reason of such position or authority.
- (6) No official or employee of the city shall engage in or accept employment or render services for any private or public interest when that employment or service is incompatible or in conflict with the discharge of his or her official duties or when that employment may tend to impair his or her independence of judgment or action in the performance of his or her official duties.

This section shall not prohibit a part-time elected or appointed city official from engaging in private employment or business on his or her own time as a private citizen and where city business is not involved, subject to his or her disclosing such private employment or business on the public record for any matter on which he or she may be called upon to act in his or her official capacity, in accordance with Section 5 B below. He or she shall refrain from voting upon or otherwise participating in debate on any such matter.

- (7) No official or employee of the city shall participate, as an agent or representative of the city, in the negotiation or execution of contracts, granting of subsidies, fixing of rates, issuance of permits or certificates, or other regulation or supervision, relating to any business entity in which he or she has, directly or indirectly, a financial or personal interest.
- (8) No official or employee of the city shall use, or attempt to use, his or her official position to secure, request or grant unreasonably any special consideration, privilege, exemption, advantage, contract or preferential treatment for himself, herself, or others, beyond that which is available to every other citizen.
- (9) It is recognized that various boards and committees are part of the plan of government for the city. As such, it is further recognized that by virtue of the various requirements for membership of the board, a member may be placed in the position of participating in a decision that may directly or indirectly affect his or her financial or personal interests. Therefore, those members of the various boards and committees in the city, as they may be established from time to time, may participate in such decisions provided that they act:
- a. In furtherance of the public good;
 - b. In compliance with the duties of their respective boards; and,
 - c. In a manner consistent with subsection (8) of this section.
- (10) Determination of conflict of interest. A conflict of interest exists if:
- a. The city official or employee has any financial or personal interest, beyond ownership of his or her place

of residence, in the outcome of a matter currently before that city official or employee, or is associated as owner, member, partner, officer, employee, broker or stockholder in an enterprise that will be affected by the outcome of such matter, and such interest is or may be adverse to the public interest in the proper performance of said official's or employee's governmental duties, or;

- b. The city official or employee has reason to believe or expect that he or she will derive a direct monetary gain or suffer a direct monetary loss, as the case may be, by reason of his or her official activity, or;
- c. The public official has any other prohibited interest as defined by state statutes relating to conflicts of interest.

(11) Subsequent conflict of interest. No official or employee of the city shall acquire any financial interest in or accept any employment concerning any project which has been granted approval by the city or any commission, board, department or employee thereof within one year of the official's or employee's participation in any manner in considering or recommending the approval or disapproval of said project.

(b) *Full disclosure.*

(1) Responsibility to disclose. It shall be the responsibility of the official or employee to disclose the full nature and extent of his or her direct or indirect financial or personal interest in a matter before him or her.

No official or employee of the city shall participate, as an agent or representative of the city, in approving, disapproving, voting, abstaining from voting, recommending or otherwise acting upon any matter in which he or she has directly or indirectly a financial or personal interest. The official or employee shall, in such circumstances, recuse himself or herself from the matter before him or her.

(2) Disclosure of conflict of interest and disqualification.

a. Any city official or employee who has a conflict of interest, as defined herein, in any matter before the city shall disclose such fact on the appropriate record of the city prior to discussion or action thereon and shall refrain from participating in any discussion, voting or action thereon, as follows, provided that such exceptions shall be observed as are permitted by law:

1. A city commissioner shall disclose any conflict of interest and the nature and extent of such interest on the record of the city commission;
2. A member of any city board, commission or committee shall disclose any conflict of interest and the nature and extent of such interest on the records of said board, commission or committee;
3. A city employee who has a financial or other interest in a matter before the city commission or any city board, commission or committee and who participates in discussion with, or gives an official opinion to the city commission, or to such other city board, commission or committee relating to such matter, shall disclose on the records of the city commission or such other city board, commission or committee, as the case may be, any conflict of interest and the nature and extent of such interest.
4. Otherwise, any appointed city official or employee shall address such a disclosure to the supervisory head of his or her department, and any elected city official shall address such a disclosure to the general public.

b. If a city official, commissioner or employee who has a conflict of interest, as defined herein, in any matter before the city, and who discloses that conflict on the appropriate records but who refuses to refrain from discussion, deliberation or voting thereon, the matter under consideration shall be immediately

referred to the board of ethics for a final determination as to the conflict in question and whether the official, commissioner or employee must refrain from discussion, deliberation, action or voting thereon.

- c. Within 20 days after election, employment, appointment, or the effective date of this ordinance, or any change in the facts set forth in the city official's or employee's previously filed disclosure statement, each city official and employee shall file with the city clerk an affidavit and disclosure statement. The city clerk shall provide each city official or employee with the required affidavit and disclosure statement form immediately upon his or her election, employment or appointment. The affidavit and disclosure statement does not apply to part-time and temporary employees of the city. Additionally, the disclosure requirements on this section do not apply to regular full-time employees below the level of assistant department head, except at the discretion of the city manager.
- d. The effective date for this ordinance shall be July 21, 2003.

(Ord. No. 1805, 4-28-03; Ord. No. 1810, 5-19-03; Ord. No. 1819, 1-12-04)

Sec. 2-325. - Violation, enforcement and advisory opinions.

(a) *Board of ethics.*

- (1) The city commission shall appoint a board of ethics, consisting of three members, as an advisory body for the purpose of interpreting this code of ethics.
- (2) The initial three members of the board of ethics shall be appointed for one-, two-, and three-year terms of office respectively, which shall begin on July 1, 2003. If appointed prior to July 1st, they shall begin their terms of office immediately and their terms shall include the additional time prior to July 1st. Terms of office shall expire on June 30th of the respective years.

Thereafter, all members shall be appointed to three-year terms, beginning July 1, so that only one member's term expires each year. A member shall hold office until his or her successor is appointed. The city commission shall fill a vacancy by an appointment for the unexpired term only.

- (3) The board of ethics shall be made up of residents of the city who have legal, administrative or other desirable qualifications.
 - a. The members of the board of ethics shall serve without compensation, and shall not be elected officials, persons appointed to elective office, full-time appointed officials or city employees, nor shall they be currently serving on any other city board or commission.
 - b. The board shall select its own presiding officer from among its members.
 - c. The board shall establish such procedures it deems necessary or appropriate to perform its functions as set forth in this article.

(b) *Functions of the board of ethics.* When there is a question or a complaint as to the applicability of any provision of this code to a particular situation, that question or complaint shall be directed to the board of ethics. It shall then be the function of the board of ethics to conduct hearings and/or issue an advisory opinion, as applicable.

- (1) Hearings. The board of ethics shall follow the following hearing procedure:
 - a. The board shall, within seven days after any matter is brought to its attention, set a date certain for hearing said matter.
 - b. The board shall, at least 28 days before the hearing date, send notice of such hearing, accompanied by a concise statement of the alleged breach of this code of ethics, to any person requested to appear before

them, by certified mail, return receipt requested, to addressee only.

- c. Any person requested to appear before a board of ethics hearing may request one extension for a period not to exceed 28 days. Extensions thereafter will be granted only under extreme circumstances.
 - d. Any person requested to appear before a board of ethics hearing may be accompanied by his or her attorney.
 - e. All hearings at which any person shall be requested to appear shall be subject to the Open Meetings Act.
 - f. All findings of board hearings shall be published in permanent form and communicated to the city commission and the public, subject to the requirements of the Open Meetings Act.
- (2) Advisory opinions. All advisory opinions so issued shall also be published in permanent form and communicated to the city commission and the public, subject to the requirements of the Open Meetings Act.
- (3) After the board of ethics' advisory opinions and/or hearing findings have been published:
- a. The city commission shall be responsible for imposing any sanction for a violation of this Code on one of its members or any person appointed by the commission to any city board.
 - b. If it becomes necessary to seek the removal of a city official after the board of ethics' advisory opinion and/or hearing findings, the city shall follow the requirements for removal of a public official in accordance with the laws of the state.
 - c. The city manager shall be responsible for imposing any discipline for a violation of this Code on any employee of the city.

(Ord. No. 1805, 4-28-03; Ord. No. 1810, 5-19-03; Ord. No. 1819, 1-12-04)

Sec. 2-326. - Affidavit and disclosure statement.

Immediately following an election, employment or appointment of a city official or employee, the city clerk shall provide the individual with an affidavit and disclosure statement form. Within 20 days after election, appointment, employment or any change in the facts set forth in the city official's or employee's previously filed affidavit and disclosure statement, all city officials or employees shall file with the city clerk an affidavit and disclosure statement including the following:

- A. A disclosure statement responding in detail to the following questions:
 - 1. To the best of your knowledge, do you or any members of your immediate family own any interest in real property located within the City of Birmingham, in land contiguous to the City of Birmingham, or in any area covered by a 425 Agreement to which the City of Birmingham is party?
 - 2. If your answer to question 1. is affirmative, to the best of your knowledge state the following information for each such interest owned:
 - (a) The nature of your interest in the real property;
 - (b) The location of the real property (for improved property, provide the street address; for unimproved property state its location in relation to existing streets), and;
 - (c) The property's permanent real estate tax identification number.
 - 3. To the best of your knowledge, do you or members of your immediate family own five percent (5%) or more of any business entity located in the City of Birmingham?
 - 4. If your answer to question 3. is in the affirmative, state the following, to the best of your knowledge:
 - (a) The name of the entity;

- (b) The address of the entity;
- (c) The nature of your relationship to the entity, and;
- (d) The date relationship commenced.

5. To the best of your knowledge, do you or any members of your immediate family have any direct financial or business relationships with any supplier, service provider or contractor of the City of Birmingham from which you or they derive direct compensation or financial benefit that is not reported in the prior answers.
 6. To the best of your knowledge, have you or any members of your immediate family given or received any gifts, other than from immediate family members, the value of which exceeds \$50.00, within the last year, or since the effective date of this code, whichever time period is shorter, to or from any person or business or other legal entity doing business with the City, other than legal campaign contributions? If so, list the names and addresses of each donor or donee of each such gift and the date upon which it was made and the nature of the gift.
- B. An affidavit in which the City official or employee states: "I have read and I understand the Code of Ethics of the City of Birmingham and, to the best of my knowledge, I am not in conflict with its provisions."

Dated:

Subscribed and sworn to before me this ___ day of _____, 20__.

Notary Public

_____ County, Michigan

My Commission Expires:_____

(Ord. No. 1805, 4-28-03; Ord. No. 1810, 5-19-03; Ord. No. 1819, 1-12-04)



BOARD OF ETHICS PROCEDURAL RULES

Chapter 1. Policy and Construction.

Rule 101. Intent.

The City of Birmingham Board of Ethics (the board) promulgates these rules pursuant to the City of Birmingham's Code of Ethics with the intent of realizing the policies and goals set forth in that code and in the board's own mission statement. The board intends to conduct its business consistent with all applicable federal, state and local laws.

Rule 102. Construction.

These rules are to be construed to achieve the timely, efficient and cost-effective determination of matters brought before the board.

Rule 103. The board may modify these rules on a case-by-case basis to further this policy.

Chapter 2. Procedure for Obtaining Advisory Opinions.

The rules of this chapter apply to the situation where a city official or employee, the City Commission, or another city commission, board or committee, as defined in the Code of Ethics ("the requesting party"), requests an advisory opinion as to whether the requesting party's conduct or anticipated conduct, or that of a city official, employee, commission, board or committee under the requesting party's authority, conforms to the Code of Ethics. The party whose conduct is sought to be reviewed, if it is someone other than the requesting party, is called the "subject party."

Rule 201. Request for Advisory Opinion.

The request for advisory opinion must be in writing and filed with the city clerk on a form prescribed by the clerk who will present it to the board for consideration. The requesting party may include with the request any documents that may assist the board in responding to the request.

Rule 202. Dismissal.

- a. The city clerk may administratively dismiss a request for an advisory opinion if the request fails to comply with Rule 201 of this Chapter.
- b. The board may administratively dismiss a request for an advisory opinion for either of the following reasons:
 - (i) One or more requests or complaints regarding the same matter are pending.
 - (ii) The board previously addressed the subject matter.

Rule 203. Additional Information.

Upon presentation of a request for an advisory opinion, the board may direct the city clerk to obtain additional information regarding the request.

Rule 204. Summary Decision.

At any time, the board may issue an advisory opinion decision on the request based on any of the following reasons:

- a. The board lacks jurisdiction over the requesting or subject party.
- b. The board lacks jurisdiction over the subject matter.
- c. The requesting party lacks the legal capacity to request an advisory opinion.
- d. The request for an advisory opinion is barred because of release, prior judgment, or other disposition of the matter before the request for an advisory opinion was filed.
- e. The request for advisory opinion on its face fails to demonstrate any violation of the code of ethics.

Rule 205. Summary Opinion.

If no genuine issue as to any material fact exists, the board may issue an advisory opinion without a hearing.

Rule 206. Scheduling.

If the request for an advisory opinion is not resolved under Rule 204 or 205, the board may schedule a meeting or hearing in accordance with the Rules of this Chapter.

Rule 207. Meeting Date.

The clerk will set the matter for meeting on a date certain and place the matter on the board's calendar. The board may hold a hearing to review, or further review, the merits of a request for an advisory opinion.

Rule 208. Notice of Meeting and Requests to Others to Appear.

The clerk will send notice of the meeting to the requesting party and, where applicable, to the subject party in the manner prescribed by the Code of Ethics. The board may request other persons to appear at the meeting by directing the clerk to send notice of the meeting and a request to appear, accompanied by a copy of the request for advisory opinion.

Rule 209. Appearance of Requesting Party, Subject Party, or Representative.

The requesting party and, where applicable, the subject party, or a representative of either, may appear at the meeting, present information to support or oppose the request, and respond orally to questions presented by the board.

Rule 210. Meetings, Generally.

The board will conduct a meeting on the matter set forth in the request for advisory opinion at the scheduled time. Any person requested to appear at the meeting may be accompanied by an attorney.

Rule 211. Presiding Officer.

The Chairperson of the board will act as the presiding officer for the meeting or may assign another member of the board to be the presiding officer. The presiding officer

will officiate over the meeting; moderate the questions and answers between members of the board, the requesting party, the subject party, and any other witness; and rule on questions of procedure and the admissibility of evidence. The presiding officer will consult with other members of the board before making any decision.

Rule 212. Presentation of the Request and the Evidence.

The requesting party will present the request by stating the issue to be resolved and giving any evidence that bears on the matter. The subject party, where applicable, may likewise present any evidence that bears on the matter. The board may request the testimony of other witnesses and the introduction of exhibits or other evidence relevant to the matter. The requesting party, the subject party, and any member of the board may question any witness in the manner directed by the presiding officer. All witnesses will give testimony on sworn oath or affirmation.

Rule 213. Post-Meeting Evidence.

The board may request the requesting party, the subject party where applicable, or any other person to submit post-meeting evidence if warranted.

Rule 214. Closure of the Record.

The record is closed at the conclusion of the meeting or, if the board requests any person to submit post-meeting evidence, at the earlier of the submission of the evidence or the deadline for submitting it. The board may re-open the record and take additional evidence before rendering its decision.

Rule 215. Advisory Opinion.

The board will determine whether the conduct or anticipated conduct of the requesting party or the subject party, as the case may be, conforms to the Code of Ethics. The board will make its decision upon a vote of a majority of the board based upon the evidence in the record and controlling law. The board will issue its decision in the form of a written advisory opinion. The advisory opinion, and any dissenting or concurring opinion, will be stated in writing. Once they are issued, the opinions are final.

Rule 216. Transmittal of the Advisory Opinion or Order.

The board will send its advisory opinion or order to the city clerk, who will publish, distribute and keep it in the manner prescribed in the ordinance and in conformity with applicable law. The clerk will mail the requesting party, the subject party, the affected department, and other persons as the board directs, a copy of the opinion or order.

Chapter 3. Procedure for Resolving Complaints.

The rules in this chapter apply to the situation where any person has a complaint against a city official or employee, as defined in the Code of Ethics, alleging that the conduct of that official or employee is in breach of the code.

Rule 301. Filing of Complaint.

A person with a complaint involving the applicability of any provision of the Code of Ethics with respect to the conduct of a city official or employee may bring the matter before the board by filing with the city clerk a complaint on a form prescribed by the

clerk. The person who files the complaint is called the “complainant.” The person who is alleged to have breached the code is called the “respondent.”

Rule 302. Dismissal.

- a. The city clerk may administratively dismiss a complaint if it fails to comply with Rule 301 of this Chapter.
- b. The board may administratively dismiss a complaint for either of the following reasons:
 - (i) One or more complaints or requests for advisory opinions regarding the same matter are pending.
 - (ii) The board previously addressed the subject matter.

Rule 303. Additional Information.

Upon the filing of a complaint, the board may direct the city clerk to obtain additional information regarding the request.

Rule 304. Summary Decision.

At any time, the board may issue a decision on the complaint based on any of the following reasons:

- a. The board lacks jurisdiction over the respondent.
- b. The board lacks jurisdiction over the subject matter.
- c. The complainant lacks the legal capacity to assert the complaint.
- d. The complaint is barred because of release, prior judgment, or other disposition of the complaint before the complaint was filed.
- e. The complaint on its face fails to demonstrate any violation of the code of ethics.

Rule 305. Summary Opinion.

If no genuine issue as to any material fact exists, the board may issue a decision on the complaint without a hearing.

Rule 306. Scheduling.

If the complaint is not resolved under Rule 205 and 206, the board may schedule a meeting or hearing in accordance with the Rules of this Chapter.

Rule 307. Hearing Date.

Within seven (7) days of the filing of the complaint, the clerk will set the matter for hearing on a date certain and place the matter on the board’s calendar in accordance with the ethics ordinance and these procedural rules.

Rule 308. Service of Complaint on, and Notice to, Respondent.

At least twenty-eight (28) days before the hearing date, the clerk will send notice of the hearing, accompanied by a copy of the complaint to the respondent in the manner prescribed by the code.

Rule 309. Notice of Hearing to Complainant and Requests to Others to Appear.

After setting the matter for hearing, the clerk will notify the complainant of the hearing date in the manner prescribed by the Code of Ethics. The board may request other persons to appear at the hearing by directing the clerk to send notice of the hearing and

a request to appear, accompanied by a copy of the complaint in the manner prescribed by the code.

Rule 310. Answer of Respondent.

Ahead of the hearing date, the respondent may submit a written answer to the complaint by filing that answer with the city clerk. In the answer, the respondent may respond to the allegations set forth in the complaint and may further provide information, including documents, relevant to the matter. In lieu of a written answer, the respondent may appear at the hearing and respond orally to the allegations in the complaint.

Rule 311. Hearings, Generally.

The board will conduct a hearing on the matter alleged in the complaint at the scheduled time. Any person requested to appear at the hearing may be represented by an attorney.

Rule 312. Presiding Officer.

The Chairperson of the board will act as the presiding officer for the hearing or may assign another member of the board to be the presiding officer. The presiding officer will officiate over the hearing and rule on questions of procedure and the admissibility of evidence. The presiding officer will consult with other members of the board before making any decision.

Rule 313. Opening Statements.

The opening statement is the parties' way to introduce the matter to the board, summarize the evidence that will be presented during the hearing, and state the relief requested. The complainant and the respondent may each give an opening statement. Usually, the complainant will give the first opening statement, but the board may vary this procedure.

Rule 314. Conduct of Proceedings

- a. The complainant will present evidence to support the complaint. The respondent may then present evidence to support any defense. Witnesses for each party will also submit to questions from the complainant, the respondent, and the board. The board has the discretion to vary this procedure, provided that the parties are treated with equality and that each party has the right to be heard and is given a fair opportunity to present its case.
- b. The board, exercising its discretion, will conduct the proceedings with a view to expediting the resolution of the matter and may direct the order of proof, bifurcate proceedings and direct the parties to focus their presentations on issues the decision of which could dispose of all or part of the matter.
- c. The parties may agree to waive oral hearings in any case.

Rule 315. Evidence

- a. The parties may offer such evidence as is relevant and material to the matter and will produce such evidence as the board may deem necessary to an understanding and determination of the matter. Conformity to legal rules of evidence will not be necessary. All evidence will be taken in the presence of the

- board and all of the parties, except where any of the parties is absent, in default or has waived the right to be present.
- b. The board will determine the admissibility, relevance, and materiality of the evidence offered and may exclude evidence deemed by the board to be cumulative or irrelevant.
 - c. The board will take into account applicable principles of legal privilege, such as those involving the confidentiality of communications between a lawyer and client.

Rule 316. Closing Statements.

When the parties have finished presenting their evidence, each may make a closing statement summarizing the evidence, stating the relief requested, and arguing in favor of that relief. Usually, the respondent will give the first closing statement, to be followed by the complainant, but the board may vary this procedure.

Rule 317. Post-Hearing Briefs.

The board may request the parties to submit post-hearing briefs if warranted.

Rule 318. Closure of the Record.

The record is closed at the conclusion of the hearing or, if the board requests the parties to submit post-hearing briefs, at the earlier of the submission of the briefs or the deadline for submitting them. The board may re-open the record and take additional evidence before rendering its decision.

Rule 319. Decision.

The board will determine whether the respondent's conduct as alleged in the complaint or demonstrated at the hearing is in breach of the Code of Ethics. The board will make its decision upon a vote of a majority of the board based upon the evidence in the record and controlling law. The board will issue its decision in the form of a written opinion. The opinion, and any dissenting or concurring opinion, will be stated in writing. Once they are issued, the decision and opinions are final.

Rule 320. Transmittal of the Decision.

The board will send its decision to the city clerk, who will publish, distribute and keep it in the manner prescribed by the ordinance and in conformity with applicable law. The clerk will mail each party, the affected department, and other persons as the board directs, a copy of the decision.

Chapter 4. Procedure for Deciding Referred Questions of Disqualification Due to Conflict of Interest.

The rules in this chapter apply to the situation where, under Section 2-324 of the Code of Ethics, a city official or employee has a conflict of interest in any matter before the city, as defined in the code, has disclosed that conflict on the appropriate records of the city, but refuses to refrain from discussion, deliberation or voting on that matter. In that instance, the affected city body may request the board to decide the question of whether the official or employee must refrain from discussion, deliberation, action or voting on the matter because of disqualification due to a conflict of interest. The rules in this chapter contemplate that the referred question be decided on an expedited basis.

Rule 401. Referral of Question of Disqualification.

The city, its commission, or any city board or committee, which is called the "referring body," may refer to the board the question of whether an official or employee is disqualified from discussion, deliberation, action or voting on any pending matter due to a conflict of interest. The referring body will refer the question of disqualification to the board by filing the question with the city clerk on a form prescribed by the clerk. The referring body may include with the referred question any information and documents that may assist the board in answering the referred question. The person who is alleged to be disqualified due to conflict of interest is called the "respondent."

Rule 402. Dismissal.

- a. The city clerk may administratively dismiss a referred question of disqualification if the referral fails to comply with Rule 401 of this Chapter.
- b. The board may administratively dismiss a referred question of disqualification for either of the following reasons:
 - (i) One or more questions regarding the same matter are pending.
 - (ii) The board previously addressed the subject matter.

Rule 403. Additional Information.

Upon referral of a question of disqualification, the board may direct the city clerk to obtain additional information regarding the request.

Rule 404. Summary Decision.

At any time, the board may issue a decision on the referred question of disqualification based on any of the following reasons:

- a. The board lacks jurisdiction over the respondent.
- b. The board lacks jurisdiction over the subject matter.
- c. The referring body lacks the legal capacity to refer the question to the board.
- d. Decision on the question is barred because of release, prior judgment, or other disposition of the question before the question was referred.
- e. The question on its face fails to demonstrate any conflict of interest or reason for disqualification.

Rule 405. Summary Opinion.

If no genuine issue as to any material fact exists, the board may issue a decision without a hearing.

Rule 406. Scheduling.

If the referred question of disqualification is not decided under Rule 404 and 405, the board may schedule a meeting or hearing in accordance with the Rules of this Chapter.

Rule 407. Hearing Date.

As soon as practicable after the referred question of disqualification is filed, the clerk will set the matter for hearing on a date certain, which may be that very day, and place the matter on the board's calendar. The board may convene and conduct the hearing immediately upon the clerk's receipt of the referred question, or may set another time for the hearing.

Rule 408 Notice of Hearing and Requests to Others to Appear.

The clerk will notify the referring body and the respondent of the hearing. Notice may be given orally or in any other form reasonably calculated to give the date, time, location and subject matter of the hearing. The board may request other persons to appear at the hearing by directing the clerk to notify those persons of the request and transmitting a copy of the referred question to them.

Rule 409 Hearings, Generally.

The board will conduct a hearing on the referred question at the scheduled time.

Rule 410. Presiding Officer.

The Chairperson of the board will act as the presiding officer for the hearing or may assign another member of the board to be the presiding officer. The presiding officer will officiate over the hearing, and rule on questions of procedure and the admissibility of evidence. The presiding officer will consult with other members of the board before making any decision.

Rule 411. Appearance of Referring Body and Respondent.

The referring body and the respondent may appear at the hearing, present information on the referred question of disqualification and respond orally to questions presented by the board. The referring body will designate one of its members or another person to act as its representative for the hearing.

Rule 412. Opening Statements.

The opening statement is the parties' way to introduce the question to the board, summarize the evidence that will be presented during the hearing, and state the party's position on the question. The referring body and the respondent may each give an opening statement. Usually, the referring body will give the first opening statement, but the board may vary this procedure.

Rule 413. Conduct of Proceedings

- a. The referring body will present evidence on the question of disqualification. The respondent may then present evidence to support his or her position on the question. Witnesses for each party will also submit to questions from the referring body and the respondent. The board has the discretion to vary this procedure, provided that the parties are treated with equality and that each party has the right to be heard and is given a fair opportunity to present its case.
- b. The board, exercising its discretion, will conduct the proceedings with a view to expediting the resolution of the matter and may direct the order of proof, bifurcate proceedings and direct the parties to focus their presentations on issues the decision of which could dispose of all or part of the matter.
- c. The parties may agree to waive oral hearings in any matter.

Rule 414. Evidence

- a. The parties may offer such evidence as is relevant and material to the question and will produce such evidence as the board may deem necessary to an understanding and determination of the question. Conformity to legal rules of evidence will not be necessary. All evidence will be taken in the presence of the board and all of the parties, except where any of the parties is absent, in default or has waived the right to be present.

- b. The board will determine the admissibility, relevance, and materiality of the evidence offered and may exclude evidence deemed by the board to be cumulative or irrelevant.
- c. The board will take into account applicable principles of legal privilege, such as those involving the confidentiality of communications between a lawyer and client.

Rule 415. Closing Statements.

When the parties have finished presenting their evidence, each may make a closing statement, summarizing the evidence, stating the position it takes on the question, and arguing in favor of that position. Usually, the respondent will give the first closing statement, to be followed by the referring body, but the board may vary this procedure.

Rule 416. Post-Hearing Briefs.

The board may request the parties to submit post-hearing briefs if warranted.

Rule 417. Closure of the Record.

The record is closed at the conclusion of the hearing or, if the board requests the parties to submit post-hearing briefs, at the earlier of the submission of the briefs or the deadline for submitting them. The board may re-open the record and take additional evidence before rendering its decision.

Rule 418. Decision.

The board will decide whether the respondent is disqualified from discussion, deliberation, action or voting on the matter pending before the referring body due to a conflict of interest. The board will make its decision upon a vote of a majority of the board based upon the evidence in the record and controlling law. The board will issue its decision in the form of a written opinion. The opinion, and any dissenting or concurring opinion, will be stated in writing. Once they are issued, the decision and opinions are final.

Rule 419. Transmittal of the Decision.

The board will send its decision to the city clerk, who will publish, distribute and keep it in the manner prescribed in the ordinance and in conformity with applicable law. The clerk will provide the referring body, the affected department, and the respondent with a copy of the decision.

Revised 10/03
Revised 05/04
Revised 10/06
Revised 12/06
Revised 1/08
Revised 9/11



AFFIDAVIT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

According to section 2-326 of the Birmingham City Code, "Immediately following an election, employment or appointment of a City official or employee, the City Clerk shall provide the individual with an Affidavit and Disclosure Statement form. Within twenty days after election, appointment, employment or any change in the facts set forth in the City official's or employee's previously filed Affidavit and Disclosure Statement, all City officials and employees shall file with the City clerk an Affidavit and Disclosure Statement." Ordinance 1810 – Effective July 21, 2003

Date _____

Name _____

Position/Board _____

1. To the best of your knowledge do you or any members of your immediate family own any interest in real property located within the City of Birmingham, in land contiguous to the City of Birmingham, or in any area to which the City of Birmingham is party?

2. If your answer to question 1 is affirmative, to the best of your knowledge state the following information for each such interest owned:
 - a. The nature of your interest in the real property _____

 - b. The location of the real property (for improved property, provide the street address; for unimproved property state its location in relation to existing streets)

 - c. The property's permanent real estate tax identification number _____

3. To the best of your knowledge, do you or a member of your immediate family own five percent (5%) or more of any business entity located in the City of Birmingham _____?
4. If your answer to question 3 is in the affirmative, state the following, to the best of your knowledge:
 - a. The name of the entity _____
 - b. The address of the entity _____
 - c. The nature of your relationship to the entity _____
 - d. The date relationship commenced _____



Case No. _____
(Assigned by clerk)

REQUEST FOR ADVISORY OPINION

The Procedural Rules of the Board of Ethics allow a city official or employee, the City Commission, or another city commission, board or committee, as defined in the Code of Ethics ("the requesting party"), to request an advisory opinion as to whether the requesting party's conduct or anticipated conduct, or that of a city official, employee, commission, board or committee under the requesting party's authority, conforms to the Code of Ethics. The party whose conduct is sought to be reviewed, if it is someone other than the requesting party, is called the "subject party."

All advisory opinions will be communicated to the city commission and will be published on the city's website at www.bhamgov.org.

Written requests are subject to disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act.

Name _____ Phone Number (____) _____

Address _____
(Number, Street, City, State, Zip)

Position or Board (If Applicable) _____

- A. State each question upon which an opinion is desired. Attach additional sheets of paper if the space provided below is not sufficient.
- B. State all of the facts giving rise to each question presented.
- C. If available, provide all relevant statutory provisions, case law, prior opinions of the Ethics Board, and other authorities.

NOTE: Although the foregoing criteria are subject to exception when the circumstances warrant, a request which does not meet these criteria may be returned and the requestor asked to resubmit the request in an appropriate form.

Please return requests to: City Clerk's Office, City of Birmingham
151 Martin, P.O. Box 3001, Birmingham, MI 48012

Revised 8/16/12

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY

Accepted by _____ Date _____



Case No. _____
(Assigned by clerk)

ETHICS INCIDENT/COMPLAINT FORM

Any person who has a complaint against a city official or employee, as defined in the Code of Ethics, alleging that conduct of that official or employee is in breach of the code, may bring the matter before the Birmingham Board of Ethics by filing this form with the city clerk. Within seven days upon receipt of this filing, the clerk will set a hearing for this matter and notify the parties involved according to the ordinance.

All advisory opinions will be communicated to the city commission and will be published on the city's website at www.bhamgov.org.

Written requests are subject to disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act.

- 1. Name the person alleged to have violated one or more provisions of the City of Birmingham's Ethics Ordinance (Chapter 2, Article IX), and provide the following information, if known. If you are alleging that more than one person may have violated the City of Birmingham's Ethics Ordinance, file a separate complaint form for each individual. The information on this form may be subject to disclosure under the Freedom of Information Act.

Name _____ Phone Number (____)_____

Address _____
(Number, Street, City, State, Zip)

Position or Board _____

- 2. Explain why you believe that the individual named above may have violated the City of Birmingham's Ethics Ordinance. Be as specific as possible as to dates, times, places, and actions. Attach additional sheets of paper if the space provided below is not sufficient. Also note which specific section in the ordinance was violated.

