City of Birmingham
A Walkable Community

MEMORANDUM

Community Development Department

DATE: **January 19, 2015**

TO: **Joseph A. Valentine, City Manager**

CC: **Jana Ecker, Planning Director**

FROM: **Matthew Baka, Senior Planner**

SUBJECT: **To set a Public Hearing for Final Site Plan & Special Land Use Permit Amendment at 1775 Melton – Eton Academy**

On January 14, 2015, the Planning Board conducted a public hearing to discuss a request by the applicant to renovate the former St. Columban Church at 1775 Melton in order to expanding the existing school facilities and construct a one-story addition to connect the school and former church building. In addition the applicant proposes to make minor changes to the site plan to improve circulation and student safety. The Planning Board voted unanimously to recommend approval of the Final Site Plan and Design and the Special Land Use Permit to the City Commission.

Thus, the Planning Division requests that the City Commission set a public hearing date for **February 23, 2015** to consider approval of the Final Site Plan and Special Land Use Permit amendment to allow the expansion of the Eton Academy into the former St. Columban Church building. Please find attached the staff report presented to the Planning Board, along with the relevant meeting minutes for your review.

SUGGESTED ACTION:
To set a public hearing date for **February 23, 2015** to consider the Final Site Plan and Special Land Use Permit Amendment at 1775 Melton to allow the expansion of the Eton Academy into the former St. Columban Church building.

City of Birmingham
A Walkable Community

MEMORANDUM

Community Development

DATE: **January 6, 2015**

TO: **Planning Board**

FROM: **Matthew Baka, Senior Planner**

SUBJECT: **1755 & 1775 Melton – Preliminary & Final Site Plan Review and Special Land Use Permit - Eton Academy expansion into the former St. Columban Church**

Executive Summary

The Eton Academy site is located at 1755 Melton, just north of Fourteen Mile Road. The former St. Columban Church is located immediately south of the Academy at 1775 Melton. Both properties are currently zoned R-2 (Single Family Residential). Eton Academy operates under a SLUP at their location, as did the former St. Columban Church. As this is a Special Land Use Permit, the Planning Board will review the plans and make a recommendation to the City Commission. The City Commission's approval of the Special Land Use Permit application or amendment shall constitute approval of the site plan and design.

On November 11, 2013, Eton Academy was approved for a Special Land Use Permit Amendment to purchase the existing St. Columban Church building, parking lot and property at 1775 Melton. At this time, the applicant is seeking approval to convert the existing Church for office and tutoring space. The applicant has submitted plans that illustrate their proposal to convert the former Church into classroom and office space. The plans also show the proposal to establish connections between the existing school building and Church through a covered walkway at the front of the buildings and a newly constructed learning center, lobby and hallway system connecting the rear of the Church building and the existing Eton Academy. These changes also include the creation of a new courtyard between the buildings, revised pedestrian circulation and minor changes to the vehicle circulation.

On November 19, 2014, the Planning Board reviewed the Preliminary Site Plan review and SLUP amendment application. At that time, the application was postponed to January 14, 2015 to allow the applicant time to provide additional information on the potential impact the proposal would have on parking, flows, and circulation. In addition, the Board requested that information be provided on pick up and drop times and location at the site. It was agreed by the Board that they would review the Preliminary and Final site plans at that time in order to minimize any delays in the review process.

1.0 Land Use and Zoning

1.1 Existing Land Use - The existing site contains the existing Eton Academy, and the former St. Columban Church. The Church was purchased by the Eton Academy

and added to the SLUP by the City Commission on Sep. 25, 2013 with the understanding that the applicant would be required to return to the City for approval of any site changes. Land uses surrounding Eton Academy and the Church are single family residential, with the exception of Our Sheppard Lutheran Church to the south.

1.2 Existing Zoning - Currently zoned R-2, Single-Family Residential. The surrounding uses appear to conform to the permitted uses of each particular Zoning District.

1.3 2016 Regulating Plan - The subject site is located outside of the Downtown Birmingham Overlay District.

1.4 Birmingham Future Land Use Plan- Policy #4 outlined in the Residential Development Policies section of the Birmingham Future Land Use Plan states that stringent site design standards should be required for community facilities which are located within residential neighborhoods. Particular emphasis should be placed on provision of adequate off-street parking, landscaping and screening.

1.5 Summary of Land Use and Zoning - The following chart summarizes existing land use and zoning adjacent to and/or in the vicinity of the subject site.

	North	**South**	**East**	**West**
Existing Land Use	Single-Family Residential	Our Sheppard Lutheran Church	Single-Family Residential	Single-Family Residential
Existing Zoning District	R-2, Single-Family Residential	R-2, Single-Family Residential	R-2, Single-Family Residential	R-2, Single-Family Residential

2.0 Use of Site

The use of a private school is a permitted use with a Special Land Use Permit in the R2 zoning district. Both Eton Academy and the St. Columban Church were originally approved for operation independently with their respective Special Land Use Permits on March 14, 1988. As a result of the Eton Academy's purchase, the SLUP for St. Columban Church was revoked, and the SLUP for Eton Academy was amended to include the Church property.

3.0 Setback and Height Requirements

The applicant proposes to construct a covered walkway along the front elevation of the site that will connect the two buildings. The applicant is also proposing to build an

addition on the rear elevation of the site that will add 2,090 sq. ft. Neither of these changes will increase the height of the structures nor will they decrease the required setbacks.

4.0 Screening and Landscaping

4.1 Mechanical Screening – No new mechanical equipment is currently proposed for either property.

4.2 Parking Lot Screening – No changes are proposed for the existing parking lot screening.

4.3 Dumpster Screening – No changes proposed.

4.4 Landscaping – The applicant has indicated that the landscape plan was not ready in time to include in this report. However, the have contracted Michael Dul and Associates to complete the plan and will submit it for review prior to the meeting.

5.0 Parking and Circulation

5.1 Parking –No changes to the parking area for the Academy or the Church property are proposed. However, the previous SLUP approval was granted with the condition the Eton Academy and St. Columban Church entered into a shared parking agreement that stipulated simultaneous events would not be held between the two sites and that use of the auditorium and dining area would not coincide with concentrated usage of the gymnasium. Since the Eton Academy has acquired the St. Columban Church building the shared parking agreement is no longer valid. Therefore, the applicant must provide the required on-site parking for both buildings.

The parking requirement is determined by calculating a combination of office space (1/300 sq. ft.), classrooms, and assembly area (1 space for each six person capacity or seats). The plans as submitted indicate that 141 parking spaces will be provided on site. The information submitted by the applicant indicates 7,888 sq. ft. of office space (7,888/300 = 26 spaces), 421 classroom/study area seats (421/6 = 70 spaces), and 13,741 sq. ft. of additional space that includes the library, gymnasium, auditorium and various computer and reading labs (137 occupancy per Building Code/6 = 23 spaces).This parking analysis shows that the applicant will be required to provide 121 parking spaces with 141 on site. **Accordingly, the proposal meets the parking requirement.**

5.2 Loading - No loading zone is designated and none is required.

5.3 Pedestrian Access and Circulation - Pedestrian access to the site is provided directly from the public sidewalk on Melton. The applicant is proposing to expand and slightly modify the existing walk configuration. However, the access points will remain generally the same.

5.4 Vehicle Access and Circulation – Per the request of the Planning Board the applicant has provided a written description of the circulation plan for vehicles during the drop-off and pick-up time for students as well as after school activities. **Please see the attached letter from the applicant for details.**

6.0 Lighting

No new lighting is proposed at this time.

7.0 Departmental Reports

7.1 Engineering Division – The Engineering Dept. has completed its review of the above referenced plan dated December 19, 2014. The following comments are offered:

1. It appears that both the parking lot and the existing building will be larger than the existing. The engineer designing the project shall calculate the increased impervious surface proposed over the existing. If the increased area is greater than 3,500 sq. ft., a Storm Water Runoff Permit will be required. The permit will require that storm water be detained on site before entering the sewer system.

   Other than the Storm Water Runoff Permit noted above, no other permits are required from the Engineering Dept.

7.2 Department of Public Services – No concerns were reported from the Department of Public Services at this time.

7.3 Fire Department - No concerns were reported from the Fire Department at this time.

7.4 Police Department - No concerns were reported from the Police Department.

7.5 Building Department –The Building Department provided their standard comments.

8.0 Design Review

The applicant proposes to make exterior changes to the buildings that will establish connections between the current school building and Church through a concrete walkway and screenwall at the front of the buildings and a newly constructed learning center, lobby and hallway system connecting the rear of the Church building and the existing Eton Academy. Also the gymnasium is proposed to be newly clad in cedar siding. **The applicant will provide material samples at the time of the Final site plan review.**

Pedestrian screen wall

The applicant is proposing to create a decorative wood screenwall along the front elevation of the former Church building. The wall begins at the southwest corner of the building and extends north towards the existing school. The wall will connect to the southwest corner of the school. At that location there will be an opening for access into the courtyard.

Rear addition of Learning Center, Lobby and Hallway

The proposed addition at the rear of the buildings will be constructed of brick and aluminum framed glazing in a wood structure. The proposal shows a brick sill wall along the lower portion of the addition with the two tiered aluminum glazing system stacked above. The roof line will be finished with a new break metal fascia. Between the two buildings the applicant is proposed a new timber framed lobby that will create a covered connection which will act as the main entrance for the students.

9.0 Approval Criteria

In accordance with Article 7, section 7.27(B) of the Zoning Ordinance, the proposed plans for development must meet the following conditions:

(1) The location, size, and height of the building, walls, and fences shall be such that there is adequate landscaped open space so as to provide light, air and access to the persons occupying the structure.

(2) The location, size, and height of the building, walls, and fences shall be such that there will be no interference with adequate light, air and access to adjacent lands and buildings.

(3) The location, size, and height of the building, walls, and fences shall be such that they will not hinder the reasonable development of adjoining property and not diminish the value thereof.

(4) The site plan, and its relation to streets, driveways and sidewalks, shall be such as to not interfere with or be hazardous to vehicular and pedestrian traffic.

(5) The proposed development will be compatible with other uses and buildings in the neighborhood and will not be contrary to the spirit and purpose of this chapter.

(6) The location, shape, and size of required landscaped open space is such as to provide adequate open space for the benefit of the inhabitants of the building and the surrounding neighborhood.

10.0 Approval Criteria for Special Land Use Permits

Article 07, section 7.34 of the Zoning Ordinance specifies the procedures and approval criteria for Special Land Use Permits. Use approval, site plan approval, and design review are the responsibilities of the City Commission. This section reads, in part:

> Prior to its consideration of a special land use application (SLUP) for an initial permit or an amendment to a permit, the **City Commission shall refer the site plan and the design to the Planning Board for its review and recommendation. After receiving the recommendation, the City Commission shall review the site plan and design of the buildings and uses proposed** for the site described in the application of amendment.

The City Commission's approval of any special land use application or amendment pursuant to this section shall constitute approval of the site plan and design.

11.0 Recommendation

Based on a review of the Site Plan submitted, the Planning Department recommends APPROVAL for the Preliminary & Final Site Plan Review and Special Land Use Permit Amendment for 1755 and 1775 Melton to the City Commission with the following conditions;

1. Provide a complete landscape plan for review and approval.

12.0 Sample Motion Language

Motion to recommend APPROVAL of the Preliminary & Final Site Plan Review and Special Land Use Permit Amendment for 1755 and 1775 Melton to the City Commission with the following conditions;

1. Provide a complete landscape plan for review and approval.

OR

Motion to recommend Denial of the Special Land Use Plan Amendment for 1755 and 1775 Melton.

OR

Motion to recommend Postponement of the Special Land Use Plan Amendment for 1755 and 1775 Melton.

DRAFT MINUTES
CITY OF BIRMINGHAM
REGULAR MEETING OF THE PLANNING BOARD
WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 14, 2015
City Commission Room
151 Martin Street, Birmingham, Michigan

Minutes of the regular meeting of the City of Birmingham Planning Board held on January 14, 2015. Chairman Scott Clein convened the meeting at 7:30 p.m.

Present: Chairman Scott Clein; Board Members Carroll DeWeese, Bert Koseck, Gillian Lazar, Janelle Whipple-Boyce, Bryan Williams; Alternate Board Member Daniel Share; Student Representative Shelby Wilson (left at 9:15 p.m.)

Absent: Board Member Robin Boyle; Alternate Board Member Stuart Jeffares; Student Representative Jack Moore

Administration: Matthew Baka, Senior Planner
Jana Ecker, Planning Director
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

Chairman Clein introduced and welcomed the new alternate member, Daniel Share.

01-05-15

SPECIAL LAND USE PERMIT ("SLUP")
PRELIMINARY AND FINAL SITE PLAN REVIEW
1755 and 1775 E. Melton (postponed from November 19, 2014)
Eton Academy
Construction of a one-story addition to connect the school and former church building

Mr. Baka advised the former St. Columban Church is located immediately south of the Eton Academy at 1775 Melton. Both properties are currently zoned R-2 (Single Family Residential). Eton Academy operates under a SLUP at their location, as did the former St. Columban Church.

On November 11, 2013, Eton Academy was approved for a SLUP Amendment to purchase the existing St. Columban Church building, parking lot and property at 1775 Melton. At this time, the applicant is seeking approval to convert the existing church for office and tutoring space.

On November 19, 2014, the Planning Board postponed the application to January 14, 2015 to allow the applicant time to provide additional information. The board agreed to review the Preliminary and Final Site Plans at that time.

As this is a SLUP, the Planning Board will review the plans and make a recommendation to the City Commission. The City Commission's approval of the SLUP application or amendment shall constitute approval of the site plan and design.

Design Review
The plans show the proposal to establish connections between the existing school building and church through a concrete walkway and decorative wood screenwall at the front of the buildings and a newly constructed learning center, lobby and hallway system connecting the rear of the church building and the existing Eton Academy. Also, the existing gymnasium is proposed to be newly clad in cedar siding.

Chairman Clein received confirmation that the addition is 2,090 sq. ft.

Mr. Robert Hewer with Lord-Aeck-Sargent Architecture explained the link between the two buildings is not a covered walkway because they would have to move a transformer to a different location. The fence protects the interior area that they envision as a play area for the lower school. Also, it masks what is currently the main entry. Holes in the fence allow people to peak through. They have taken the paving away from the front of the building and it will all be landscaped. Mr. Hewer went on to describe the circulation plan. They have significantly increased the queuing available in the parking lot as opposed to out on Melton.

Motion by Mr. DeWeese
Seconded by Mr. Williams to recommend approval of the Preliminary and Final Site Plan Review and SLUP Amendment for 1755 and 1775 Melton, Eton Academy, to the City Commission.

Mr. Koseck commented the applicant has done a lot to improve the site and he thinks they have done it beautifully. Chairman Clein appreciates their efforts in highlighting the transportation and circulation.

There were no final public comments on the motion at 7:48 p.m.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE
Yeas: DeWeese, Williams, Clein, Koseck, Lazar, Share, Whipple-Boyce
Nays: None
Absent: Boyle

CITY OF BIRMINGHAM
SPECIAL MEETING OF THE PLANNING BOARD
WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 19, 2014
City Commission Room

151 Martin Street, Birmingham, Michigan

Minutes of the special meeting of the City of Birmingham Planning Board held on November 19, 2014. Chairman Scott Clein convened the meeting at 7:30 p.m.

Present: Chairman Scott Clein; Board Members Bert Koseck, Gillian Lazar, Janelle Whipple-Boyce

Absent: Board Members Robin Boyle, Carroll DeWeese, Bryan Williams; Student Representatives Jack Moore, Shelby Wilson

Administration: Matthew Baka, Senior Planner
Ken Cooper, Asst. Building Official
Jana Ecker, Planning Director
Bruce Johnson, Building Official
Scott Lenhart, Building Dept.
Shalaka Puranik. Asst. Planner
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

Ms. Ecker introduced part-time planner Shalaka Puranik.

11-172-14

SPECIAL LAND USE PERMIT AMENDMENT ("SLUP")
PRELIMINARY SITE PLAN REVIEW
1755 and 1775 Melton
Eton Academy
SLUP Amendment and Revised Final Site Plan Review for the expansion of the existing school into the neighboring former St. Columban Church building, with new construction to connect buildings

Mr. Baka advised the former St. Columban Church is located immediately south of the Eton Academy at 1775 Melton. Both properties are currently zoned R-2 (Single Family Residential). Eton Academy operates under a SLUP at their location, as did the former St. Columban Church.

On November 11, 2013, Eton Academy was approved for a SLUP Amendment to purchase the existing St. Columban Church building, parking lot and property at 1775 Melton. At this time, the applicant is seeking approval to convert the existing church for office and tutoring space. Since the Eton Academy has acquired the St. Columban Church building their shared parking agreement is no longer valid. Therefore the applicant must provide the number of seats for each classroom and the auditorium in order to determine the exact number of parking spaces required.

As this is a SLUP, the Planning Board will review the plans and make a recommendation to the City Commission. The City Commission's approval of the SLUP application or amendment shall constitute approval of the site plan and design.

Design Review
Mr. Baka advised that the plans show the proposal to establish connections between the existing school building and church through a covered walkway at the front of the buildings and a newly constructed learning center, lobby and hallway system connecting the rear of the church building and the existing Eton Academy. These changes also include the creation of a new courtyard between the buildings and revised pedestrian circulation. A full design review of these changes will be done at Final Site Plan Review.

Mr. Robert Huer with Lord-Aeck-Sargent Architecture explained that in the design of the new facility they tried to better the condition for the neighborhood with their proposed daily pick-up and drop-off traffic pattern that will reduce congestion and safety concerns.
In response to Ms. Lazar, he said the parking area and lighting will remain as existing.

Mr. Pete Pullen, Head of School, explained how arrivals and departures of students work now. At the end of the day there are three different times that students leave the school, just to relieve congestion. For whole school special events they share parking with the Lutheran Church. Ms. Whipple-Boyce asked to see those numbers at Final Site Plan Review. Mr. Pullen said they have 213 students in grades 1 through 12 that attend the school. When the addition is in place, they will have capacity for 300 students.

Chairman Clein stated he needs to understand the parking, flows, and circulation before he can approve the Preliminary Site Plan. He is concerned with the number of vehicles, along with the number of vehicles coming in and out of one driveway with headlights pointing at the residences. Also with how the changes to the site will impact the surrounding residences.

Mr. Pullen replied they will put together a more complete plan for the site. Their growth plan is based on a financial plan that will add five to ten students per year. They don't sense that will be a major problem for their neighbors. Their biggest challenge is the time between 3 and 3:30 p.m.

The board members concluded they want to analyze additional factual information.

Chairman Clein thought it would be good for the board to hold a study session to consider what details applicants should provide for Preliminary Site Plan Review in the future.

Motion by Ms. Whipple-Boyce
Seconded by Mr. Koseck to continue the Special Land Use Permit Amendment ("SLUP") and Preliminary Site Plan Review for 1755 and 1775 Melton, Eton Academy to the meeting of January 14, 2015.

Consensus was that the Final Site Plan could also be reviewed at that time.

There was no discussion from members of the public at 9:43 p.m.

Motion carried, 4-0.

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Whipple-Boyce, Koseck, Clein, Lazar
Nays: None
Absent: Boyle, DeWeese, Williams

PLANNING BOARD MINUTES
SEPTEMBER 25, 2013

SPECIAL LAND USE PERMIT ("SLUP") REVIEW
1755 Melton
Eton Academy
Purchase of St. Columban Church for Eton Academy administrative offices and tutoring

FINAL SITE PLAN REVIEW
1755 Melton
Eton Academy
Purchase of St. Columban Church for Eton Academy administrative offices and tutoring

Ms. Ecker explained the Eton Academy site is located at 1755 Melton, just north of Fourteen Mile Rd. The former St. Columban Church is located immediately south of the Academy at 1775 Melton. Both properties are currently zoned R-2 (Single Family Residential). Eton Academy operates under a SLUP at their location, as did the former St. Columban Church.

Ms. Ecker advised that at this time, Eton Academy is requesting a SLUP Amendment to purchase the existing St. Columban Church building, parking lot and property at 1775 Melton. They wish to revoke the former SLUP for St. Columban Church and then expand the SLUP for Eton Academy to include the church property with no exterior changes at this time. Currently the applicant intends to use the existing church for office and tutoring space. The applicant has advised that no exterior renovations are presently proposed. Eton Academy has plans to expand classroom space into the Church in the future, and will apply for a subsequent SLUP Amendment at that time. They have taken down the St. Columban sign and put up a new Eton Academy sign. All signage has to be reviewed and approved through the SLUP process. It would appear that signage that was put up does not comply because it is a pole sign.

As this is a SLUP, the Planning Board will review the plans and make a recommendation to the City Commission. The City Commission's approval of the
SLUP application or amendment shall constitute approval of the site plan and design.

Mr. Robert Huer, Lord-Aeck-Sargent Architecture, spoke to represent Eton Academy. Originally the school and the church were one parcel. The school purchased the bigger part of the property and continued it as a school. The arrangement was always that if the church came up for sale Eton Academy would have the right of first refusal. The school plans to move some office space into the newly acquired building in order to have room for more classrooms.

With regard to parking, Mr. Huer explained right now there are 142 spaces and Eton utilizes 70% of those. The enrollment numbers won't change significantly; therefore the parking will be sufficient.

Ms. Ecker read an e-mail which stated the need for a second entrance/exit to or from the parking lot so the students may be dropped off and picked up in the parking lot. Driving on Melton is difficult when school is dismissed for the day because cars are lined up on one side to pick up students and there is parking on the other side.

Mr. Pete Pullen, 1102 Cedar Hill, Royal Oak, said he is head of the school. He noted that on occasion they hire busses for field trips.

There were no comments from the public at 9:20 p.m.

Motion by Mr. Koseck
Seconded by Ms. Whipple-Boyce to recommend approval of the SLUP Amendment for 1755 and 1775 Melton to the City Commission with the condition that the applicant submit all signage details for review prior to going before the City Commission for review and approval of the SLUP Amendment.

No one from the audience wished to comment on the motion at 9:22 p.m.

Motion carried, 7-0.

VOICE VOTE
Yeas: Koseck, Whipple-Boyce, Boyle, Clein, DeWeese, Lazar, Williams
Nays: None
Absent: None