

**HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 2, 2020**
Held Remotely Via Zoom And Telephone Access

Minutes of the regular meeting of the Historic District Commission ("HDC") held Wednesday, September 2, 2020. Chairman John Henke called the meeting to order at 7:06 p.m.

1) ROLL CALL

Present: Chairman John Henke; Vice-Chairman Keith Deyer; Board Members Gigi Debbrecht, Natalia Dukas, Patricia Lang, Michael Willoughby

Absent: Board Members Doug Burley; Alternate Member Kevin Filthaut

Administration: Nicholas Dupuis, City Planner
Laura Eichenhorn, Transcriptionist

09-57-20

2) Approval Of Minutes

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Ms. Debbrecht to approve the HDC Minutes of August 19, 2020 as submitted.

Motion carried, 6-0.

ROLL CALL VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Debbrecht, Dukas, Deyer, Henke, Lang

Nays: None

09-58-20

3) Courtesy Review

None.

09-59-20

4) Historic Design Review

A. 743 Frank - King-Argus House

City Planner Dupuis reviewed the item.

Mr. Willoughby said he thought it would be more appropriate for someone who restores historic windows to do the evaluation of the condition of the windows on the home. He said the proposed designs for the front door were also inappropriate for a historic home.

Ms. Debbrecht stated that she visited the home and walked through the interior. She said that she had seen many windows in historic homes in vastly worse condition than the windows at 743 W. Frank. Ms. Debbrecht agreed with Mr. Willoughby that someone more familiar with window restoration should evaluate the windows, and that the proposed front door design was not historic in nature. She added that the front door was not in bad condition.

Chairman Henke agreed with Mr. Willoughby and Ms. Debbrecht that an expert in window restoration should be the one to evaluate the condition of the windows. Chairman Henke said that lead paint and a small amount of wood rot is an insufficient reason to replace historic windows.

In reply to John Simlik, general contractor for the project, Chairman Henke said that neither the safety of the second floor windows or the desire to install tempered glass would be a sufficient reason to replace the windows. Chairman Henke said that it was unfortunate that the historic windows can be less safe than current options but explained that is part of living in a historic home.

Kabir Mendiratta, owner, emphasized his concerns regarding the safety of the windows especially in terms of potentially having children in the home. He stated that as a doctor he has seen a number of children who have gone through windows and ended up with glass in their faces and bodies that had to be removed. He said he also made a number of other upgrades to the home for reasons of safety even though they would not have been required because he feels so strongly about the home being safe.

Chairman Henke said he understood Dr. Mendiratta's concerns, and that the way to increase the safety of the home would be to make changes to the exterior **interior**. He stated that the HDC is tasked with protecting the exterior historical integrity of a historic home, and explained that there was nothing the HDC could do in a case like this.

Other HDC members stated Dr. Mendiratta could put plexiglass along the lower portion of the windows on the inside of the home, or could install wrought iron bars running across the lower portion of the windows on the inside in order to prevent a child from accidentally breaking through the windows.

Dr. Mendiratta emphasized his passion for maintaining the historic integrity of the home, while also emphasizing that safety is of the utmost importance. He asked if the city could provide any financial assistance for making the historically compatible changes he has made to the home. He noted that living in a historic home would remain the purview of the very wealthy if the community does not offer any support to owners who want to make the most historically appropriate upgrades but cannot afford the extra costs.

In reply to Chairman Henke, Dr. Mendiratta said he was willing to have someone who professionally restores historic windows evaluate the windows on his home.

Ms. Debbrecht said the proposed plans for the rear of the home, pergola and railings were attractively designed and contextually appropriate.

In reply to Dr. Mendiratta, Mr. Willoughby explained how to maintain the historic integrity of the front door design. He noted that the top of the glass on the sidelights of the door does not align with the top of the front door. Mr. Willoughby stated that is a subtle but important characteristic of historic homes. He also said that the HDC would need to be able to review and approve specific design plans for the front door, and that they would not be able to offer their approval based on conceptual designs. He encouraged Dr. Mendiratta to seek out historical data on what the front door originally looked like in order to provide sufficient information for both Dr. Mendiratta and the HDC. He said if that can be found that the designs should replicate that, and that if original information on the door design cannot be found then the design of the current door should be replicated.

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Ms. Debbrecht to approve the proposed plans for the rear of 743 W. Frank and to postpone review of the plans for the front and side of the house to a future meeting.

Motion carried, 6-0.

ROLL CALL VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Debbrecht, Dukas, Deyer, Henke, Lang

Nays: None

09-60-20

5) Sign Review

None.

08-54-20

6) Study Session

None.

08-55-20

7) Miscellaneous Business and Communication

A. Pre-Application Discussions

B. Staff Reports

- 1. Administrative Sign Approvals**
- 2. Administrative Approvals**
- 3. August Demolitions**
- 3. Action List - 2020**
- 4. Historical Preservation Collaboration Matrix**

08-56-20

Adjournment

Motion by Mr. Willoughby

Seconded by Ms. Debbrecht to adjourn the HDC meeting of September 2, 2020 at 7:51 p.m.

Motion carried, 6-0.

ROLL CALL VOTE

Yeas: Willoughby, Debbrecht, Dukas, Deyer, Henke, Lang

Nays: None

Nicholas Dupuis
City Planner

APPROVED