

**CITY OF BIRMINGHAM  
PLANNING BOARD ACTION ITEMS  
OF WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 24, 2018**

Item	Page
<b>FINAL SITE PLAN AND DESIGN REVIEW SPECIAL LAND USE PERMIT ("SLUP")</b>	
<b>1. 33588 Woodward Ave. (Shell Gas Station/Dunkin Donuts) Request for approval of a Revised Final Site Plan and Design to allow for construction of small addition for a restroom and new signage</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Motion by Ms. Whipple-Boyce Seconded by Mr. Boyle to recommend APPROVAL the Final Site Plan and Special Land Use Permit amendment to the City Commission for 33588 Woodward Ave., Birmingham Shell, with the following conditions: (1) The applicant confirm that the ice and propane storage units are no more than 4 ft. in height, or obtain a variance from the BZA; (2) The applicant meet the requirements of all City Departments.</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Motion carried. 7-0.</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>2. 191 N. Chester (Church of Christ, Scientist, renamed The Jeffrey) Request for approval of the Final Site Plan and Design to allow for exterior design and site changes to the existing building to convert to office use larger than 3,000 sq. ft. in size</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Motion by Ms. Whipple-Boyce Seconded by Mr. Williams to recommend APPROVAL the Final Site Plan and Special Land Use Permit to the City Commission for 191 N. Chester, The Jeffrey, with the following conditions: 1. The applicant must add an additional tree along Willits, or obtain a waiver from the Staff Arborist; 2. The applicant replace the proposed Sweet Gum trees along Chester and provide irrigation for trees; 3. The applicant must submit revised plans showing the placement and measurements of one off-street loading space, or obtain a variance from the BZA; 4. The applicant will need to submit revised plans showing a railing made of metal, wood, cast concrete, or stone, or obtain a variance from the BZA; and 5. The applicant add bike racks.</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Motion carried, 7-0.</b>	<b>6</b>

Item	Page
<b>FINAL SITE PLAN AND DESIGN REVIEW</b>	
<b>3. 885 Redding (new two-family construction)</b> <b>Request for approval of the Final Site Plan and Design Review to allow for construction of a new two-family residence</b>	<b>6</b>
<p style="padding-left: 40px;"><b>Motion by Mr. Boyle</b></p> <p><b>Seconded by Ms. Whipple-Boyce to APPROVE the Final Site Plan for 885 Redding with the following conditions:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>1. The Planning Board approves the use of non-cut-off light fixtures as proposed;</b></li> <li><b>2. The applicant must indicate what material will be used to screen the ground mounted mechanical;</b></li> <li><b>3. The applicant must provide one evergreen tree or obtain a variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals;</b></li> <li><b>4. The applicant addresses the concerns of all City Departments; and</b></li> <li><b>5. The applicant reduces the dimensions of the rear turning areas to add to the percentage of permeable surfaces on-site.</b></li> </ol> <p><b>Motion carried, 7-0.</b></p>	<b>7</b>
	<b>8</b>

APPROVED

---

**CITY OF BIRMINGHAM  
REGULAR MEETING OF THE PLANNING BOARD  
WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 24, 2018  
City Commission Room  
151 Martin Street, Birmingham, Michigan**

---

Minutes of the regular meeting of the City of Birmingham Planning Board held on January 24, 2018. Chairman Scott Clein convened the meeting at 7:30 p.m.

**Present:** Chairman Scott Clein; Board Members Robin Boyle, Stuart Jeffares, Bert Koseck, Vice-Chairperson Gillian Lazar, Janelle Whipple-Boyce, Bryan Williams

**Also Present:** Nasseem Ramin

**Absent:** Alternate Board Member Daniel Share; Student Representatives Ariana Afrakhteh, Isabella Niskar

**Administration:** Matthew Baka, Sr. Planner  
Nicholas Dupuis, Planning Intern  
Carole Salutes, Recording Secretary

**01-12-18**

**APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE REGULAR PLANNING BOARD MEETING OF JANUARY 24, 2018**

**Motion by Mr. Boyle  
Seconded by Mr. Williams to approve the minutes of the Regular Planning Board Meeting of January 24, 2018 as presented.**

**Motion carried, 7-0.**

**VOICE VOTE**

Yeas: Boyle, Williams, Clein, Jeffares, Koseck, Whipple-Boyce

Nays: None

Abstain: Lazar

Absent: None

**01-13-18**

**CHAIRPERSON'S COMMENTS**

The chairman explained that the Final Site Plans and Special Land Use Permits will be taken together for 33588 Woodward Ave. and 191 N. Chester.

01-14-18

**APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA** (no change)

01-15-18

**FINAL SITE PLAN AND DESIGN REVIEW  
SPECIAL LAND USE PERMIT ("SLUP")**

**1. 33588 Woodward Ave. (Shell Gas Station/Dunkin Donuts)**

**Request for approval of a Revised Final Site Plan and Design to allow for construction of small addition for a restroom and new signage**

**Motion by Mr. Williams**

**Seconded by Ms. Lazar to receive and file the one-page document from Design Studio Interiors Planning. Project: Birmingham Gas Station Exterior Building Elevations.**

**Motion carried, 7-0.**

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Williams, Lazar, Boyle, Clein, Jeffares, Koseck, Whipple-Boyce

Nays: None

Absent: None

Mr. Baka advised the 0.34 acre subject site is located at the corner of Woodward Ave. and Chapin. The gas station was formerly a Citgo that was renovated several years ago and is now a Shell/Dunkin Donuts. The applicant is seeking a SLUP amendment to relocate the bathroom within the building, which will include a small addition of square footage to the building. The total added area is roughly 79 sq. ft. at the southwestern portion of the building, facing the parking lot. The addition will displace the ice and propane storage machines, which are proposed to be relocated to the side of the building, adjacent to the rear parking area.

***The applicant must confirm that the ice and propane storage units are no more than 4 ft. in height, or obtain a variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals ("BZA").***

*Design Review*

The proposed 79 sq. ft. addition to the southwest portion of the building will be for the relocation of a restroom to allow more counter space for the establishment. The applicant has indicated on the site plan that the addition will be constructed with the same brick and paint as the existing building. The applicant has submitted scaled and colored elevations and material specifications for Design Review.

Responding to Mr. Boyle, Mr. Baka stated that Beer and Wine signage was previously approved by the Planning Board. The Liquor signs are considered window signage as long as it is within 18 sq. ft. Therefore, the signs are compliant.

Mr. John Abbro with ADG, Farmington Hills, MI was present for Scott and Chris Barbat, the gas station owners. He explained the proposed addition will match the building design. Mr. Chris Barbat indicated the reason for the addition is to expand the counter in order to relocate the spirits from the sales area to behind the counter where customers can't get to them. He asked

to exchange the Beer and Wine channel letter sign with a liquor sign in the same style so they can get rid of the vinyl Liquor stickers on the windows.

The Chairman said he would be comfortable with an Administrative Approval for that, assuming tonight's proposal gets approved and everything else is in compliance.

Mr. Barbat added that relocating the bathroom to the front south side of the building results in a better flow of traffic where there is no conflict between the restroom line and the Dunkin Donuts line. As stated, it also allows them to take the spirits off the floor and locate them behind the counter which is safer.

Chairman Clein took public comments at 7:45 p.m.

Mr. Bob Chodum, 1408 Chapin, stated that construction of the gas station occurred after 7 p.m. week nights and on Sundays. The construction just about took over Chapin and he didn't have anywhere to park. The gas station is very close to residences and he feels it is too big for their neighborhood. Signs at the bicycle shop say to unload bicycles on Chapin and they are on City sign posts.

Ms. Joan Sutherland who also lives at 1408 Chapin asked if the proposal will alter parking at the gas station because they already park on her street and too close to the intersection.

Mr. Baka said the proposed construction will not displace any parking. Mr. Barbat stated they do not allow any of their employees to park in the street. They must park on the property. The small addition will not take out any of the parking spots. He will be very diligent in making sure the dumpster is always closed. This addition should be wrapped up within a week and in no way will they work before or after business hours.

Ms. Whipple-Boyce noted that if construction takes place other than from 7 a.m. to 7 p.m. Monday through Saturday the residents could notify the Police Dept.

Mr. Williams advised that the residents could attempt to handle some of the excess parking by petitioning for parking permits on their street. Also, they could pursue with the Police Dept. adding signs restricting right turns coming out of the gas station onto Chapin.

**Motion by Ms. Whipple-Boyce**

**Seconded by Mr. Boyle to recommend APPROVAL the Final Site Plan and Special Land Use Permit amendment to the City Commission for 33588 Woodward Ave., Birmingham Shell, with the following conditions:**

- (1) The applicant confirm that the ice and propane storage units are no more than 4 ft. in height, or obtain a variance from the BZA;**
- (2) The applicant meet the requirements of all City Departments.**

**Motion carried. 7-0.**

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Whipple-Boyce, Boyle, Clein, Jeffares, Koseck, Lazar, Williams

Nays: None

Absent: None

**2. 191 N. Chester (Church of Christ, Scientist, renamed The Jeffrey)  
Request for approval of the Final Site Plan and Design to allow for exterior design and site changes to the existing building to convert to office use larger than 3,000 sq. ft. in size**

Mr. Dupuis explained the 0.40 acre subject site is located at the corner of Chester and Willits on the outer edge of Downtown Birmingham. The Planning Board recommended approval to the City Commission for a rezoning from TZ-1 to TZ-2 on September 13, 2017 to allow the former Church of Christ Scientist building to permit office use.

The City Commission approved the request for a rezoning to TZ-2. The transformed office building is proposed to contain 16,493 sq. ft. of office space. The Zoning Ordinance limits tenants of an office building to 3,000 sq. ft. per tenant in the TZ-2 District. The proposed floor plans for the renovated office building show three tenant lease spaces, all of which will be over the permitted 3,000 sq. ft. Thus, the applicant is seeking a SLUP to allow for three office tenants to each exceed 3,000 sq. ft. in area. A highlight of the proposed transformation of the former Church use to an office use is the proposed 1,355 sq. ft. addition to the front of the building. Along with the design of an overhead garage door off of Willits, a new roof, new windows, and new paint, a new lobby addition will create an entirely new look for the building.

Based on Article 4, section 4.20 of the Zoning Ordinance, the applicant is required to have two street trees along N. Chester and five street trees along Willits. ***Thus, the applicant must add an additional tree along Willits or obtain a waiver from the Staff Arborist.***

The Dept. of Public Services states that instead of Sweet Gums along Chester St., they require a different variety of tree for this location due to the fruit of the species and the proximity to the sidewalks. Also, irrigation should be installed.

The proposed development contains 16,493 sq. ft. of office space, thus is required to provide one off-street loading space. The applicant has not proposed an off-street loading space. ***Therefore, the applicant must submit revised plans showing the placement and measurements of one off-street loading space, or obtain a variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals ("BZA").***

*Design Review*

The transformation from Church to office will include the removal of the existing porch and entry to create an addition on the front of the building to be used as the primary entryway to the building, bringing it to the property line. There will also be repairs done and paint (SW 7069 Iron Ore) added to the existing masonry, a new quartz -zinc metal roof, a new garage with a 10 ft. x 8 ft. garage door (material and color unknown), and new windows added to the building. Some material samples and colors have been provided at this time, but the missing details must be provided.

For the new addition, the applicant is proposing new grey brick (manufacturer unknown), quartz -zinc metal paneling for coping and roofing, an aluminum clear glass window system, and a new anthra-zinc metal canopy in black for the new front entrance. This will modernize the front of the building and give it more of an office building look, as opposed to a Church look. The proposed addition will bring the building to the property line and the building's street

presence will match that of the McCann Building to the east and the Integra Building to the south.

The original building will be painted charcoal grey (SW 7069 Iron Ore) and have a new grey standing seam metal roof, along with 24 new clear glass windows/doors. The applicant is also proposing to create three new patios on the property, one off of the new addition, one off of the back of the building at the first floor, and finally, one on the second floor. The patio proposed with the addition will be enclosed with a powder coated aluminum railing. The other patios will be enclosed with an aluminum and tempered glass railing system. Article 3, Section 3.04 of the Zoning Ordinance requires balconies, railings and porch structures to be wood, metal, cast concrete, or stone. ***The applicant will need to submit revised plans showing a railing made of metal, wood, cast concrete, or stone, or obtain a variance from the BZA.***

The applicant is not proposing any signage at this time. The applicant has provided window samples showing clear glass with a visual light transmittance of 80% for the new windows.

Mr. Williams received confirmation that the applicant may have to come back for a SLUP amendment when the tenants and signage are identified.

Mr. Jeffares noted there are sterile cultivars of Sweet Gum trees that do not have fruit. Mr. Baka said the applicant would have to talk to the arborist and work that out.

Mr. Boyle felt that adding street furniture does not help in that particular location. Mr. Jeffares said he cannot fathom not having a bike rack on the property, assuming the building has been named after Jeffrey Surnow. There was general agreement on the bike racks.

Mr. Kevin Biddison, Biddison Architecture, 320 Martin, thought the adjustments that are planned will greatly improve the building. The tenant signage will go on the main brick frontage on the Chester side. There is an existing ground sign on the property but they do not know if it is something they would request.

Mr. Sam Surnow, the developer, 320 Martin, agreed there is no other location for signage other than on Chester.

There were no comments from the public at 8:15 p.m.

**Motion by Ms. Whipple-Boyce**

**Seconded by Mr. Williams to recommend APPROVAL the Final Site Plan and Special Land Use Permit to the City Commission for 191 N. Chester, The Jeffrey, with the following conditions:**

- 1. The applicant must add an additional tree along Willits, or obtain a waiver from the Staff Arborist;**
- 2. The applicant replace the proposed Sweet Gum trees along Chester and provide irrigation for trees;**
- 3. The applicant must submit revised plans showing the placement and measurements of one off-street loading space, or obtain a variance from the BZA;**
- 4. The applicant will need to submit revised plans showing a railing made of metal, wood, cast concrete, or stone, or obtain a variance from the BZA; and**
- 5. The applicant add bike racks.**

Ms. Whipple-Boyce and Mr. Koseck thought the applicant did a great job with the front of the building. Mr. Williams added this is great utilization of an existing structure.

There were no comments from the public on the motion.

**Motion carried, 7-0.**

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Whipple-Boyce, Williams, Boyle, Clein, Jeffares, Koseck, Lazar

Nays: None

Absent: None

01-17-18

## **FINAL SITE PLAN AND DESIGN REVIEW**

### **3. 885 Redding (new two-family construction)**

#### **Request for approval of the Final Site Plan and Design Review to allow for construction of a new two-family residence**

Mr. Baka advised that the subject site is a 0.39 acre parcel located on the south side of Redding Rd. between Lakeside Dr. and North Old Woodward Ave. in the R-4 Zoning District. The applicant was previously approved on January 13, 2016 to construct a two-family residential development at the above-referenced address. However, the applicant decided not to build the project as approved and is now returning to the Planning Board to request approval of a new two-family residential development in a new configuration and design.

As the location and footprint of the new plan are completely different from the previous approval, the applicant is required to complete the Preliminary and Final Site Plan Approval process again. On November 29, 2017, the applicant was granted Preliminary Site Plan approval by the Planning Board with several conditions.

A landscaping plan was provided by the applicant that provides the required number of deciduous trees, however no evergreen trees are evident on the plan. ***The applicant must submit a landscaping plan that complies with the Ordinance requirements or obtain a variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals.***

#### *Design Review*

The applicant is currently proposing that the two-family structure be constructed as a row house style building with side-by-side gabled ends facing the front property line. The siding is proposed to be James Hardie lap siding with pine board trim painted white. The roof on the overhangs is proposed to be standing seam and all windows are proposed to be double hung.

Mr. Boyle expressed his opinion that the poured concrete driveways coming into the two properties take up a significant amount of the lot.

Mr. Richard Wiand with Hunter Roberts Homes said they could remove the turn-arounds in the back. He would be happy to reduce in any way possible the amount of concrete on the site, however the driveway is an efficient way of moving run-off. In response to Mr. Boyle he indicated they are building for spec.



Mr. Jeffares stated that some kind of turn-around is needed so that vehicles don't have to back out. Mr. Wiand responded they could work with the Staff to reduce the amount of concrete.

Mr. Koseck said the design is beautiful but it would fit better in some other neighborhoods within the City.

It was discussed that any changes such as the reduction of concrete or paint color could be administratively approved.

**Motion by Mr. Boyle**

**Seconded by Ms. Whipple-Boyce to APPROVE the Final Site Plan for 885 Redding with the following conditions:**

- 1. The Planning Board approves the use of non-cut-off light fixtures as proposed; 2. The applicant must indicate what material will be used to screen the ground mounted mechanical;**
- 3. The applicant must provide one evergreen tree or obtain a variance from the Board of Zoning Appeals;**
- 4. The applicant addresses the concerns of all City Departments; and**
- 5. The applicant reduces the dimensions of the rear turning areas to add to the percentage of permeable surfaces on-site.**

At this time there was no public left to comment on the motion.

**Motion carried, 7-0.**

VOICE VOTE

Yeas: Boyle, Whipple-Boyce, Clein, Jeffares, Koseck, Lazar, Williams

Nays: None

Absent: None

**01-18-18**

**MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS AND COMMUNICATIONS**

a. Communications

- Long-Range Planning Meeting is scheduled for Saturday, January 27. Mr. Williams hoped the Department would convey what he believes was the consensus of the Planning Board that the City consider retention of professional assistance for this board in conjunction with the study of retail.
- Mr. Jeffares thought glass rather than metal railings should be able to be approved along with various materials for dumpster doors instead of only wood.
- Ms. Lazar stated the Whole Foods situation is terribly disappointing in terms of visibility into the windows.
- Mr. Williams noted that between 14 Mile Rd. and Lincoln along Woodward Ave. is a sensitive area as far as increased traffic through the neighborhoods due to new developments along Woodward Ave.

- Mr. Boyle reported that there is a new bus service straight down Woodward Ave. called FAST, Frequent Accessible Safe Transit. However, there is nowhere for them to stop. So one of the northern stops is right at the junction of Maple Rd. and Woodward Ave. in the inside lane.

b. Administrative Approval Requests

- 385 S. Eton, District Lofts Building R - Placing A/C condensing unit at grade on east side of building.
- 670 S. Old Woodward Ave. - Remove and replace front door entry - Denied.
- 2023 Hazel, Eton St. Station II - Revised Final Site Plan was approved 09-28-16 to allow larger second-floor rear decks over the driveway at the Eton St. Station II Development. Future plans by other condo owners can be approved administratively if they are identical. We are requesting approval to construct the approved design at 2023 Hazel.
- 33353 Woodward Ave., Woodward Commons - Request to make minor alterations to building facade,
- 33633 Woodward Ave, Wesch Cleaners - Requesting the addition of one parking lot light pole set at max 13 ft. 0 in. located at the northwest corner of the northern parking lot to provide the required lighting within the drive area as requested by the Planning Dept. Additionally, wall mounted lights will be added to the north parking lot and will be added to the south parking lot to provide required lighting.

c. Draft Agenda for the next Regular Planning Board meeting of February 28, 2018

- Peabody Restaurant Site - Final Site Plan
- 525 Southfield Rd. - Final Site Plan
- Public Hearing on site plan submittal requirements

d. Other Business (none)

**01-19-18**

**PLANNING DIVISION ACTION ITEMS**

- a. Staff report on previous requests (none)
- b. Additional items from tonight's meeting (none)

01-20-18

**ADJOURNMENT**

No further business being evident, the Chairman adjourned the meeting at 8:50 p.m.

Jana L. Ecker  
Planning Director

APPROVED